



# UNIVERSITÀ DI PARMA

## ARCHIVIO DELLA RICERCA

University of Parma Research Repository

Study of the bacterial diversity of foods: PCR-DGGE versus LH-PCR

This is the peer reviewed version of the following article:

*Original*

Study of the bacterial diversity of foods: PCR-DGGE versus LH-PCR / Garofalo, Cristiana; Bancalari, Elena; Milanović, Vesna; Cardinali, Federica; Osimani, Andrea; SAVO SARDARO, Maria Luisa; Bottari, Benedetta; Bernini, Valentina; Aquilanti, Lucia; Clementi, Francesca; Neviani, Erasmo; Gatti, Monica. - In: INTERNATIONAL JOURNAL OF FOOD MICROBIOLOGY. - ISSN 0168-1605. - 242:(2017), pp. 24-36. [10.1016/j.ijfoodmicro.2016.11.008]

*Availability:*

This version is available at: 11381/2818372 since: 2022-01-18T14:22:44Z

*Publisher:*

Elsevier B.V.

*Published*

DOI:10.1016/j.ijfoodmicro.2016.11.008

*Terms of use:*

Anyone can freely access the full text of works made available as "Open Access". Works made available

*Publisher copyright*

note finali coverpage

(Article begins on next page)

10 July 2025

1 **Study of the bacterial diversity of foods: PCR-DGGE versus LH-PCR**

2

3 Cristiana Garofalo<sup>a</sup>, Elena Bancalari<sup>b</sup>, Vesna Milanović<sup>a\*</sup>, Federica Cardinali<sup>a</sup>, Andrea Osimani<sup>a</sup>, Maria Luisa Savo  
4 Sardaro<sup>b</sup>, Benedetta Bottari<sup>b</sup>, Valentina Bernini<sup>b</sup>, Lucia Aquilanti<sup>a</sup>, Francesca Clementi<sup>a</sup>, Erasmo Neviani<sup>b</sup>, Monica  
5 Gatti<sup>b</sup>

6

7 *<sup>a</sup>Dipartimento di Scienze Agrarie, Alimentari ed Ambientali, Università Politecnica delle Marche, via Brecce Bianche,*  
8 *60131 Ancona, Italy*

9 *<sup>b</sup>Dipartimento di Scienze degli Alimenti, Università degli Studi di Parma, 43124 Parma, Italy*

10

11

12

13

14

15

16

17

18

19

20

21

22

23

24

25

26

27

28

29 \* *Corresponding author:* Dipartimento di Scienze Agrarie, Alimentari ed Ambientali, Università Politecnica delle  
30 Marche, via Brecce Bianche, 60131, Ancona, Italy. Tel.: +39 071 2204782; fax.: +39 071 2204988. E-mail address:  
31 [v.milanovic@univpm.it](mailto:v.milanovic@univpm.it) (V. Milanović)

32

33 **Abstract**

34

35 The present study compared the two culture-independent methods, polymerase chain reaction - denaturing gradient gel  
36 electrophoresis (PCR-DGGE) and length-heterogeneity polymerase chain reaction (LH-PCR) for revealing food  
37 bacterial microbiota. Total microbial DNA and RNA were extracted directly from fourteen fermented and unfermented  
38 foods, and domain A of the variable regions V1 and V2 of the 16S rRNA gene was analyzed through LH-PCR and  
39 PCR-DGGE. Finally, the outline of these analyses was compared with bacterial viable counts obtained after bacterial  
40 growth on suitable selective media.

41 For the majority of the samples, RNA-based PCR-DGGE revealed species that the PCR-DGGE based on DNA analysis  
42 was not able to highlight. Either by analyzing DNA and RNA, LH-PCR identified several lactic acid bacteria (LAB)  
43 and coagulase negative cocci (CCN) species that were not identified by PCR-DGGE. This phenomenon was particularly  
44 evident in food samples with viable loads  $< 5.0 \text{ Log cfu g}^{-1}$ . Furthermore, LH-PCR was able to detect an higher number  
45 of peaks in the analyzed food matrices respect to the PCR-DGGE signals. From these considerations an higher  
46 sensitivity of LH-PCR respect to PCR-DGGE may be suggested. However, PCR-DGGE, allowed the identification of  
47 some other species (LAB included) not identified by LH-PCR. By consequence, certain LH-PCR peaks not attributed to  
48 known species within the LH-PCR database could be solved by merging PCR-DGGE identification results. Overall, this  
49 study also showed that LH-PCR is a promising method for food microbiology, indicating the necessity to expand the  
50 LH-PCR database, which is based, up to now, only on LAB isolates from dairy products. This study also represents a  
51 contribution to the knowledge about the bacterial microbiota occurring in some foods that have been poorly investigated,  
52 such as seaweeds and soy-based products (tofu, soy “milk”, soy “yogurt”).

53

54 **Highlights**

- 55 • The foods' bacterial microbiota was explored by LH-PCR, PCR-DGGE and viable counts,
- 56 • The total microbial DNA and RNA were extracted directly from foods
- 57 • Only partial overlapping of bacteria was found by using LH-PCR and PCR-DGGE
- 58 • A higher sensitivity of LH-PCR respect to PCR-DGGE may be suggested
- 59 • The LH-PCR database needs to be expanded

60

61 **Keywords:** bacterial microbiota; PCR-DGGE; LH-PCR; fermented and unfermented foods; DNA; RNA

62

63

## 64 **1. Introduction**

65

66 In the food microbiology field, there is a continuous and increasing interest in profiling microbial food ecosystems in  
67 order to characterize food fermentation, to preserve foods from spoilage and to investigate the ecology of food-borne  
68 pathogens. Indeed, the food microbiota can be distinguished as pathogens, spoilage and pro-technological depending on  
69 their role in the food ecosystem. The presence and the relative abundance of one or all these groups can vary based on  
70 the type of foods and the possible contamination (generally classified in primary or secondary) or after the deliberate  
71 adjunct of starter cultures, as are often applied for fermented food production.

72 Until 30 years ago, the growth of microorganisms on synthetic media was the only way to perform microbiological  
73 investigation of foods. After the development of PCR, it has become possible to develop several molecular techniques  
74 aimed to identify the food-borne microorganisms by avoiding cultivation. These “culture-independent techniques”  
75 analyze nucleic acids (DNA and/or RNA) extracted directly from food microbial cells in order to study the microbial  
76 ecology and dynamics of food ecosystems (Cocolin et al., 2013). Several advantages of the culture-independent  
77 methods over culture-dependent methods may be underlined: i) the chance to investigate food microbial populations  
78 independently from the capacity of the microorganisms to grow on synthetic media, which is often linked to the  
79 difficulty of a such media to reproduce the microbial natural habitat conditions; ii) the microbiota of a specific food is  
80 examined irrespective of the physiological status of the microbial cells [i.e., Viable But Not Cultivable (VBNC),  
81 stressed and/or injured cells]; iii) the less represented microbial cells may not be revealed through traditional  
82 microbiological methods; iv) the rapidity and reliability of PCR-based methods (Cocolin et al., 2013; Ercolini et al.,  
83 2004).

84 Furthermore, it is important to note that it is possible to analyze either DNA or RNA using culture-independent methods.  
85 By analyzing the total microbial DNA extracted directly from a food ecosystem, it is possible to gain information about  
86 the microbial diversity. RNA analysis [and in particular analyses of the ribosomal RNA (rRNA)] is useful to define the  
87 microbial species that are either metabolically active and consequently participate in food transformation/fermentation  
88 (Cocolin et al., 2013; Dolci et al., 2013), *or dormant or dead non-lysed bacteria that can contain high numbers of*  
89 *ribosomes (Blazewicz et al., 2013).*

90 Among the several culture-independent methods based on PCR, the polymerase chain reaction - denaturing gradient gel  
91 electrophoresis (PCR-DGGE) and length-heterogeneity polymerase chain reaction (LH-PCR) techniques show great  
92 potential for outlining the microbial diversity. *PCR-DGGE has been widely used for profiling microbiota of foods and*  
93 *environmental samples since the late 1990s (Aquilanti et al., 2016a; Cocolin et al., 2013).* LH-PCR is most commonly  
94 used to monitor microbial community changes in soils or other environments different from foods (Brusetti et al., 2006;

95 Moreno et al., 2011; Suzuky, 1998). LH-PCR has been applied from 2008 to study the LAB composition of different  
96 dairy foods, such as milk, curd and cheeses during the ripening period and also in natural whey starters for cheese  
97 production (Gatti et al., 2014; Neviani et al., 2013). To our knowledge, this community-level molecular technique based  
98 on 16S rRNA gene analysis has never been used to investigate the microbiota of other foods. For this reason, the only  
99 bacterial food database available is that built with bacterial strains of dairy origin (Gatti et al., 2008; Lazzi et al., 2004).  
100 The aim of this study was to compare the efficiency of the two culture-independent methods PCR-DGGE and LH-PCR  
101 in studying the bacterial diversity of several fermented and unfermented foods in comparison with viable counts  
102 obtained after bacterial growth on different selective media. To the best of our knowledge these two techniques have  
103 never been compared before by analyzing either the total microbial DNA or RNA extracted directly from the food  
104 samples.

105

## 106 **2. Materials and Methods**

107

### 108 *2.1. Reference strains and culture conditions*

109

110 Two bacterial reference strains (*Lactobacillus brevis* DSMZ 20556 and *Lactobacillus plantarum* DSMZ 2601) were  
111 used as controls in the PCR-DGGE analyses. These cultures were purchased from the *Deutsche Sammlung von*  
112 *Mikroorganismen und Zellkulturen* (DSMZ Collection, Braunschweig, Germany, <http://www.dsmz.de/>) and grown on  
113 MRS agar (Oxoid, Basingstoke, UK) at 30°C for 48 h under anaerobiosis.

114

### 115 *2.2. Sampling*

116 The fourteen food samples were arbitrarily chosen among fermented and not fermented foods both of animal and  
117 vegetal origin. Particularly, *burrata*, butter, cream cheese, feta cheese, kefir, pasteurized milk, salami, seaweed, soy  
118 “milk”, soy sprouts, soy “yogurt”, table olives, tofu and tomatoes were analyzed. They were purchased in local  
119 groceries, and for each food sample we prepared a bulk made from 5 to 10 subsamples, taking into account different  
120 product brands and expiry dates.

121

### 122 *2.3. Sample preparation*

123 For solid foods, 10 g of each subsample was homogenized in 90 mL of sterile peptone water (0.1% peptone), by using a  
124 Stomacher apparatus (400 Circulator, International PBI, Milan, Italy) at 260 rpm for 3 min. The bulk of each solid food  
125 sample was prepared by combining all subsample homogenates in a sterile container and mixing with a magnetic stirrer

126 for 15 min. The bulks of liquid food samples were prepared by pouring 10 mL of each subsample into a sterile container  
127 and mixing as described above.

128

#### 129 2.4. Bacterial viable counts

130

131 Serial dilutions of the bulks were performed in sterile peptone water, and aliquots (100 µL for the spread-plate method  
132 or 1 mL for the pour-plate method) were streaked in triplicate onto opportune agar plates. Media and growth conditions  
133 used for enumeration of the main groups of the culturable bacteria (aerobic mesophilic bacteria, mesophilic and  
134 thermophilic streptococci, mesophilic and thermophilic lactobacilli, micrococci and staphylococci, *Pseudomonodaceae*,  
135 enterococi, total coliforms and *Enterobacteriaceae*) present in food samples are shown in Table 1. The results of the  
136 viable counts are expressed as mean ± standard deviation of the Log of colony-forming units (cfu) per gram or milliliter  
137 of sample.

138

#### 139 2.5. DNA extraction from the food samples

140

141 An aliquot (1 mL) of bulk from each food sample was centrifuged at 16,000 g for 3 min, and the microbial DNA was  
142 extracted from the pellets using a DNeasy Blood & Tissue Kit (Qiagen, Venlo, The Netherlands) according to the kit  
143 manufacturer's instructions. The DNA quantity and purity were assessed using a Nanodrop ND 1000 (Thermo Fisher  
144 Scientific, Wilmington, DE, USA).

145

#### 146 2.6. RNA extraction from the food samples and cDNA synthesis

147

148 For the extraction of microbial RNA, a 2 mL aliquot of bulk from each food sample was centrifuged for 5 min at 16,000  
149 g, the supernatants were discarded, the pellets were covered with RNA later Stabilization Solution (Ambion, Foster City,  
150 CA, USA), and they were stored at -80°C until the extraction. The total RNA was then extracted from the pellets with  
151 the RNeasy Mini Kit (Qiagen). The mechanical lyses of the cells, following the kit manufacturer's instructions, was  
152 performed using glass beads of 425-600 µm diameter (Sigma Aldrich, St. Louis, MO, USA) and a Mixer Mill MM 300  
153 (Qiagen) at 30 Hz for 5 min. The RNA extraction proceeded according to the kit manufacturer's instructions.

154 One microliter of RNase-free DNase (DNase I Amplification Grade, Sigma Aldrich) was added to 8 µL of total  
155 extracted RNA, and the mixture was incubated at 37°C for 30 min to digest all residual DNA. The RNA samples were  
156 checked for the presence of residual DNA by PCR amplification, and if PCR products were obtained, the DNase

157 treatment was repeated to eliminate DNA. The quantity and purity of the extracted RNA was determined using a  
158 Nanodrop ND 1000 (Thermo Fisher Scientific); RNA quality was further checked by agarose gel (1%) electrophoresis.  
159 Prior to cDNA synthesis, the concentration of isolated RNA was normalized to 50 ng  $\mu\text{L}^{-1}$ ; 10  $\mu\text{L}$  were then reverse  
160 transcribed in cDNA using SensiFAST cDNA Synthesis Kit for RT-qPCR (Bioline, London, UK) as recommended by  
161 the manufacturer. Oligo (dT) and random hexamer primers were used to prime the synthesis of first-strand cDNA.

162

## 163 2.7. PCR-DGGE and reverse transcription (RT)-PCR-DGGE analysis

164

### 165 2.7.1 DNA extraction from references strains

166

167 Some colonies of the pure reference cultures were suspended in 300  $\mu\text{L}$  of TE buffer (10 mM Tris-HCl pH 8.0, 1 mM  
168 EDTA pH 8.0), and the suspension underwent DNA extraction using the method proposed by Hynes et al. (1992) with  
169 some modifications as described by Osimani et al. (2015). The DNA quantity and purity were assessed as described in  
170 paragraph 2.5.

171

### 172 2.7.2. PCR-DGGE protocol

173

174 Bacterial DNA and synthesized cDNA were amplified with primers 63F (5'- CAGGCCTAACACATGCAAGTC -3')  
175 (Lane, 1991) and 355R (5'- GCTGCCTCCCGTAGGAGT -3') (Amann et al., 1990) which amplify domain A of the  
176 variable regions V1 and V2 of the 16S rRNA gene; a theoretical amplicon length of approximately 276–327 bp was  
177 expected (Castillo et al., 2006; Garcia-Garcerà et al., 2012; Grice et al., 2008; Suzuki et al., 1998). A GC clamp (5'-  
178 CGC CCG CCG CGC GCG GCG GGC GGG GCG GGG GCA CGG GGG G-3') was attached to the 5' end of the  
179 forward primer (63F). Approximately 50 ng of template DNA and 2  $\mu\text{L}$  (about 50 ng) of cDNA were amplified in a 50  
180  $\mu\text{L}$  reaction volume containing 1.25 U of *Taq* DNA polymerase (AmpliTaq Gold, Life Technologies, Milan, Italy), 1X  
181 reaction buffer, 1.5 mM  $\text{MgCl}_2$ , 0.2 mM dNTPs and 0.5  $\mu\text{M}$  of each primer. The amplification reactions were  
182 performed in a thermal cycler (My cycler, Bio-Rad Laboratories, Milan, Italy) using the following cycling program:  
183 initial denaturation at 95°C for 10 min, followed by 25 cycles of denaturation at 95°C for 45 sec, annealing at 49°C for  
184 45 sec and extension at 72°C for 2 min. The final extension was at 72°C for 7 min (Lazzi et al., 2004).

185 Five microliters of each PCR product was checked by electrophoresis in 1.5% (w/v) agarose gel in 0.5X TBE (45  
186 mM Tris-borate, 1 mM EDTA) containing 0.5  $\mu\text{g mL}^{-1}$  ethidium bromide at 100 V for 45 min, using the Hyper Ladder

187 100 bp (Bioline, London, UK) as a molecular weight standard. Gels were visualized under UV light and photographed  
188 with the Complete Photo XT101 system (Explera, Jesi, Italy).

189 A vertical electrophoresis system DCode (Bio-Rad Laboratories) was used for the DGGE analysis. PCR products (20  
190  $\mu\text{L}$ ) obtained with primers 63F<sub>GC</sub>/355R were applied to 0.8 mm polyacrylamide gel [8% (w/v)  
191 acrylamide/bisacrylamide gel 37.5:1], containing a 30-60% urea-formamide denaturing gradient that increased in the  
192 direction of the electrophoresis (100% corresponded to 7 M urea and 40% (w/v) formamide), and run with 1X TAE  
193 buffer (0.04 mol L<sup>-1</sup> Tris-acetate, 0.001 mol L<sup>-1</sup> EDTA). The gels were run at a constant voltage of 130 V for 4.5 h at  
194 60°C. After electrophoresis, the gels were stained for 20 min in TAE 1X containing SYBR Green I Stain 1X (Lonza,  
195 Walkersville, MD, USA), visualized under UV light and photographed with the Complete Photo XT101 system  
196 (Explera). To allow the standardization of band migration and gel curvature between different gels, a reference ladder  
197 made with 5  $\mu\text{L}$  of the PCR products obtained from the DNA extracted from pure cultures of each of two reference  
198 strains was loaded in the gel. Amplification reactions and DGGE runs were performed in duplicate on the same extracts.

199

### 200 2.7.3. Sequencing of the DGGE bands and sequence analysis

201

202 All the DGGE bands were excised from the gels using sterile pipette tips, and the DNA from each band was eluted in 50  
203  $\mu\text{L}$  sterile deionized water overnight at +4°C, as performed by Garofalo et al. (2008). Five microliters of the eluted  
204 DNA was re-amplified under the same conditions as described in paragraph 2.7.2., but using forward primer 63F  
205 without the GC clamp. These PCR amplicons were then sent to Beckman Coulter Genomics (London, UK) for  
206 purification and sequencing. The electropherograms were also checked and edited to remove unreadable portions  
207 (mainly at 5' and 3' ends) or to detect double peaks. Finally, the sequences in FASTA format were compared with those  
208 deposited in the GenBank DNA database (<http://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/>) using the basic BLAST search tools (Altschul  
209 et al., 1990).

210

### 211 2.8. LH-PCR analysis

212

213 The V1 and V2 16S rRNA gene regions of bacterial DNA and synthesized cDNA were amplified by using primers 63F  
214 and 355R. The 63F primer was 5' end-labelled with 6-carboxyfluorescein (FAM). Length heterogeneity in the PCR  
215 amplicons was detected by capillary electrophoresis (ABI Prism 310, Applied Biosystems, Foster City, USA). The PCR  
216 and capillary electrophoresis conditions were those described by Bottari et al. (2010). The fragment sizes (base pairs)  
217 were determined using GeneMapper software version 4.0 (Applied Biosystems, Foster City, USA) and the local

218 Southern method to generate a sizing curve from the fragment migration of the internal size standard (GS500 LIZ®;  
219 Applied Biosystems Foster City, USA). The minimum noise threshold was set at 150 fluorescence units. The peaks,  
220 corresponding to amplicons of specific length on the electropherogram profiles, represent fragments of different sizes,  
221 and the areas under the peaks depend on the amounts of the fragments (Lazzi et al., 2004). Each peak, corresponding to  
222 amplicons of specific length on the electropherogram profiles, was putatively attributed to a bacterial species according  
223 to a published database (Lazzi et al., 2004; Gatti et al., 2008). LH-PCR assays were performed in duplicate on the same  
224 DNA extracts and cDNAs used for PCR-DGGE analyses.

225

### 226 3. Results

227

#### 228 3.1. Bacterial viable counts

229

230 To support the culture-independent analyses, eight different selective media were used in order to enumerate and detail  
231 as much as possible the cultivable fraction of the main bacterial groups presumptively present in 14 food samples:  
232 mesophilic and thermophilic streptococci, mesophilic and thermophilic lactobacilli, micrococci and staphylococci,  
233 aerobic mesophilic bacteria, *Pseudomonadaceae*, enterococi, total coliforms and *Enterobacteriaceae*. The results of  
234 bacterial viable counts are shown in Tables 3 and 4. On the basis of the results of bacterial viable counts, the fourteen  
235 selected food samples were divided in two categories. The first category included samples with viable counts on PCA  
236 higher than 5.0 Log cfu g<sup>-1</sup> or Log cfu mL<sup>-1</sup> (*burrata*, feta cheese, kefir, salami, soy sprouts, soy “yogurt” and tofu)  
237 (Table 3), while the second category included samples with viable counts on PCA lower than 5.0 Log cfu g<sup>-1</sup> or Log cfu  
238 mL<sup>-1</sup> (butter, cream cheese, pasteurized milk, seaweed, soy “milk”, table olives, and tomatoes) (Table 4).

239

#### 240 3.2. PCR-DGGE and RT-PCR-DGGE analyses

241

242 The DGGE profiles obtained from the analysis of the bacterial DNA extracted directly from the 14 food samples are  
243 shown in Figure 1 (panel A). DGGE fingerprints of the bacterial communities of most of the food samples analyzed,  
244 such as tofu, soy “yogurt”, kefir, feta cheese, salami, seaweeds, butter, soy “milk”, and tomatoes, were rather simple,  
245 containing 1 to 3 different bands (Fig. 1-panel A). By contrast, soy sprouts, *burrata*, pasteurized milk, cream cheese,  
246 and table olives showed more complex DGGE profiles (from 4 to 6 bands).

247 As shown in Figure 1 (panel B), the gel obtained after RT-PCR-DGGE analysis was characterized by a profile richer in  
248 bands than that in the PCR-DGGE gel achieved by analyzing DNA. The closest relatives, the percent identities, and the

249 accession numbers of sequences obtained from the PCR-DGGE and RT-PCR-DGGE bands are reported in Table 2. For  
250 the majority of the samples, the sequencing results of the bands excised from the RT-PCR-DGGE gel highlighted  
251 species not previously detected by DNA analysis (Table 2, Table 3 and Table 4). The DNA-based PCR-DGGE  
252 technique allowed the detection of several bacterial species ascribed to *Lactobacillus*, *Leuconostoc*, *Staphylococcus*,  
253 *Pseudomonas*, *Anoxybacillus*, *Acinetobacter*, *Pantoea* and *Allomonas*, while some more species ascribed to *Bacillus*,  
254 *Bradyrhizobium*, *Sphingomonas*, *Sphingobium*, *Caldilinea*, *Sulfobacillus*, *Curvibacter*, *Lysinibacillus*, *Enterobacter*,  
255 *Aeromonas* and *Serratia* were identified through the RNA-based PCR-DGGE analysis.  
256 Unexpectedly, for foods of plant origin (except soy sprouts), the sequencing results of some or all excised DGGE bands  
257 revealed the presence of eukaryotic chloroplast DNA related to the corresponding plants. Specifically, the DNA of  
258 *Glycine soja* chloroplast was detected in soy-based foods (tofu, soy “yogurt” and soy “milk”), while the chloroplast  
259 DNA of *Solanum lycopersicum* and *Olea europea* was found in tomatoes and table olives, respectively.

260

### 261 3.3. LH-PCR analysis

262

263 Results of LH-PCR analysis consist of electropherogram profiles as shown in Figure 2. Each peak of the LH-PCR  
264 electropherogram corresponds to a DNA (or cDNA) amplicon. The different amplicon sizes of the peaks were used to  
265 identify bacterial species by comparison with LH-PCR database. LH-PCR analysis performed on the 14 food samples  
266 did not generally show differences in terms of species identification within samples by analyzing microbial DNA or  
267 RNA (Tables 3 and 4). In detail, 42 DNA and 39 cDNA amplicons were found, but among these, only 11 DNA  
268 amplicons and 10 cDNA amplicons could be attributed to known bacterial species of the LAB and cocci coagulase-  
269 negative (CCN) categories. The remaining 31 DNA amplicons and 29 cDNA amplicons did not match any known  
270 species in the LH-PCR references database (unattributed amplicons). Among these unattributed amplicons, only 14  
271 were in common between LH-PCR and RT-LH-PCR, while the other 33 (18 DNA amplicons and 15 cDNA amplicons)  
272 were different. In particular, soy “milk”, butter and tomatoes showed only unattributed DNA and cDNA amplicons  
273 (Table 4).

274

### 275 3.4 PCR-DGGE vs LH-PCR

276 Considering the number of detected peaks by DNA and RNA-based LH-PCR respect the number of species detected by  
277 DNA and RNA-based PCR-DGGE method, LH-PCR seemed to be a generally more sensitive technique for study the  
278 bacterial diversity of foods (Tables 3 and 4). In general, LH-PCR was able to identify more LAB and CCN species  
279 respect PCR-DGGE, but this latter method was able to identify even other different species. As expected, a high

280 biodiversity was observed for the first group of food samples characterized by viable load on PCA higher than 5.0 Log  
281 cfu g<sup>-1</sup> or mL<sup>-1</sup> (Table 3). In detail, *Lb. delbrueckii* (feta cheese and kefir) and *Lb. helveticus* (kefir) were the only  
282 species detected by both methods. Other LAB species such as *Str. thermophilus* (burrata, feta cheese, kefir and salami),  
283 *Lb. helveticus* (burrata, feta cheese), *Lc. lactis* (feta cheese, kefir, salami, soy sprouts), *E. faecalis* (feta cheese, kefir,  
284 tofu), *Lb. rhamnosus* (feta cheese), *P. acidilactici* (feta cheese, salami) and *Lb. plantarum* (salami) the same as CCN  
285 species *K. kristinae* (soy sprouts, tofu) were detected only by LH-PCR. Some other LAB species as *Lb. crispatus*  
286 (burrata, kefir), *Lb. ruminis* (feta cheese), *Lb. sakei* (salami), and *Leuc. mesenteroides* (feta cheese) were identified  
287 exclusively by PCR-DGGE. This method also allowed the detection of other species ascribed to *Pseudomonas*,  
288 *Staphylococcus*, *Bacillus*, *Pantoea*, *Rhizobium*, *Enterobacter*, *Lysinibacillus*, *Aeromonas* and *Serratia* throughout  
289 different food samples. PCR-DGGE detected only chloroplast DNA in soy “yogurt” while LH-PCR method was able to  
290 identify two LAB species (*Lb. delbrueckii* and *Lc. lactis*) for this food sample. Moreover, LH-PCR showed 1 (salami)  
291 to 8 (tofu) unattributed peaks for this group of analyzed samples.

292 The bacterial diversity of the second group of foods characterized by viable load on PCA lower than 5.0 Log cfu g<sup>-1</sup> or  
293 mL<sup>-1</sup> (Table 4) was poorly described by LH-PCR as some food samples like butter, soy “milk” and tomatoes had only  
294 unattributed peaks (up to 5), while other samples had only few identified peaks. *Str. thermophilus* was the only species  
295 identified in cream cheese and pasteurized milk by this method. This species was also detected in table olives together  
296 with *E. faecalis*, *Lb. helveticus*, *Lb. fermentum* and *Lb. plantarum*; the latter species was identified even by RT-PCR-  
297 DGGE. The only two species detected by LH-PCR in seaweeds were *E. faecium* and *K. kristinae*. The only LAB  
298 detected exclusively by PCR-DGGE was *Leuc. mesenteroides* in cream cheese and table olives. Using this method,  
299 other species ascribed to *Pseudomonas*, *Bradyrhizobium*, *Curvibacter*, *Acinetobacter*, *Bacillus*, *Anoxybacillus*,  
300 *Undibacterium*, *Lewinella*, *Sphingobium*, *Caldilinea*, *Sulfobacillus*, *Allomonas* and *Sphingomonas* were also detected  
301 throughout different food samples.

302

#### 303 4. Discussion

304

305 In the present study, PCR-DGGE and LH-PCR analyses were carried out by using either DNA or RNA as template to  
306 study the bacterial diversity of different foods. Specifically, rRNA has been widely applied to assess the metabolically  
307 active populations of foods and environmental communities because it has a much shorter half-life time than DNA  
308 after cell lyses (Blazewicz et al., 2013; Bleve et al., 2003; Cocolin et al., 2013; Dolci et al., 2013, 2015). Furthermore,  
309 the detection of rRNA is linked to the presence of ribosomes and therefore protein synthesis, indicating that it can be  
310 considered a suitable marker of viability (Cocolin et al., 2013; Dolci et al., 2013, 2015). However, most up-to-date

311 literature (not restricted to food-ecosystems) reveals that the general use of rRNA as a reliable indicator of metabolic  
312 state in microbial assemblages has limitations. Blazewicz et al. (2013) highlights the complex and often contradictory  
313 relationships between rRNA, growth and activity. For example, dormant cells can contain high numbers of ribosomes.  
314 Therefore, while DGGE and LH-PCR, based on DNA analyses, highlights the presence of bacteria either dead (intact  
315 and lysed) or viable or dormant, RT-PCR-DGGE and RT-LH-PCR analyses reveal the non-lysed dead cells, viable  
316 bacteria as well as the dormant cells within the food ecosystems under study. Interestingly, in the present study, in some  
317 cases RT-PCR-DGGE found bacterial species that PCR-DGGE did not (each food sample was analyzed twice and the  
318 results were reproducible). This result is in agreement with a previous study performed by Dolci and colleagues (2013)  
319 on Fontina PDO cheese. Indeed, they found that RNA was a more informative target than DNA in profiling the bacterial  
320 dynamics of this smear-ripened cheese. This phenomenon was explained by the higher abundance of rRNA copy  
321 numbers respect to 16S rRNA gene copy numbers for bacterial cells (Dolci et al., 2013; Prosser et al., 2010). This effect  
322 is even more evident for species with several copies of rRNA operon (is possible to have from 1 to 15 copies)  
323 distributed within bacterial chromosome. During PCR amplification the most abundant template are amplified and  
324 therefore RNA target analyses may result by higher sensitivity respect to DNA target analyses. It has been proposed that  
325 low represented bacterial community (less than 1% of the total microbiota) cannot be detect by using DNA-based PCR-  
326 DGGE thus limiting the complete description of a bacterial ecosystem. On the opposite, RT-PCR-DGGE may overcome  
327 this detection threshold and thus provides a more complete and reliable picture of the microbiota within a food  
328 environment (Dolci et al., 2013; Prosser et al., 2010). A few other microbiological studies have used RT-PCR-DGGE to  
329 profile the microbiota of foods and in particular cheeses, such as *Planalto de Bolona*, Castelmagno, Ragusano and feta  
330 cheese (Alessandria et al., 2010; Dolci et al., 2010; Randazzo et al., 2002; Rantsiou et al., 2008). To our knowledge,  
331 RT-LH-PCR has been applied only twice, and for studying natural whey starters used to produce Grana Padano cheese  
332 (Rossetti et al., 2009; Santarelli et al., 2008).

333 Regarding PCR-DGGE, it is interesting to note that by using either DNA or RNA, in some food samples, despite the  
334 complex DGGE profiles, after sequencing of all of the DGGE bands with different electrophoretic mobilities in the gel,  
335 the same species were found. This PCR-DGGE drawback is mainly related to the presence of 16S rRNA gene  
336 heterogeneous multi-copies in the bacterial genome of the same species (Cocolin et al., 2013; Dolci et al., 2015;  
337 Ercolini, 2004; Garofalo et al., 2015 a, b).

338 The DNA from the three food samples based on soy (tofu, soy “yogurt” and soy “milk”) showed the same DGGE  
339 profile, probably related to soy as raw material. In these three soy-based foods, together with tomatoes and table olives,  
340 the sequence alignments with sequences deposited in GenBank showed the presence of chloroplast DNA with high  
341 identity percentage (99%). This result could be explained by the fact that when studying the composition of bacteria in

342 eukaryotic organisms, a separation of nucleic acids from bacteria and eukaryotes may be impossible (Huys et al., 2008).  
343 Furthermore, the primers used in this study, targeting the V1 variable region of the bacterial 16S rRNA gene, did not  
344 present a complete specificity for bacterial DNA and amplified eukaryotic DNA as well. The presence of eukaryotic  
345 chloroplast DNA bands was more frequent in PCR-DGGE than in RT-PCR-DGGE. Large amounts of eukaryotic  
346 chloroplast/mitochondria DNA can interfere with the PCR amplification decreasing the amount of bands from the  
347 microorganisms. This negative effect can probably be reduced in RT-PCR-DGGE, because cDNA was a much purified  
348 starting material for PCR, thus further increasing the efficiency of this method with respect to DNA-based PCR-DGGE.  
349 In particular, with PCR-DGGE or LH-PCR it was not possible to define the bacterial ecology of soy “milk” except for  
350 the detection of *B. megaterium* through RT-PCR-DGGE. This result can be indeed explained by a very low bacterial  
351 contamination (low viable counts) probably resulting in a small amount of bacterial DNA extracted compared to  
352 eukaryotic DNA from soy. In contrast, despite the high viable counts obtained in soy “yogurt”, *Lb. delbrueckii* and *Lc.*  
353 *lactis* were the bacterial species identified solely by LH-PCR. In tofu, RT-PCR-DGGE allowed the identification of  
354 various species and genera belonging to *Enterobacteriaceae*, such as *En. cloacae*, *Enterobacter* sp., *En. ludwigii*,  
355 *Serratia* sp., and *Aeromonas* sp. This result was also confirmed by the bacterial load obtained on VRBA ( $5.1 \pm 0.02$  Log  
356 cfu g<sup>-1</sup>) and VRBGA ( $3.8 \pm 0.13$  Log cfu g<sup>-1</sup>) for this type of soy-based food. By LH-PCR and RT-LH-PCR, we detected  
357 *E. faecalis* and *K. kristinae*. This finding is in agreement with previous studies conducted on traditional fermented  
358 soybean products (Feng et al., 2013) and with the viable counts on M17, MRS, SBA and MSA.  
359 In soy sprouts, spoilage agents such as *Pseudomonas* sp. and *Ps. plecoglossicida* together with *Pantoea* sp., *P.*  
360 *anthophila* and *R. giardinii* were found by means of PCR-DGGE and RT-PCR-DGGE. The detection of *Pseudomonas*  
361 sp. was also confirmed by viable counts on PAB, highlighting a high level of this contaminant corresponding to  $8.3 \pm$   
362  $0.08$  Log cfu g<sup>-1</sup>. *Pseudomonas* sp. includes Gram-negative rod-shaped bacteria considered food spoilage agents of  
363 proteinaceous foods such as meat, poultry, fish, shellfish, milk and some dairy products (Franzetti and Scarpellini,  
364 2007; Liao, 2006). Soy natural contaminants *K. kristinae* (Feng et al., 2013) and *Lc. lactis* were also found by LH-PCR  
365 and RT-LH-PCR.  
366 Among the complex and extremely variable microbiota of kefir (Prado et al., 2015), *Lb. helveticus* and *Lb. delbrueckii*  
367 (although this latter with sequence identity lower than 97%) were found by either PCR-DGGE or LH-PCR with both  
368 approaches (DNA and RNA). RT-PCR-DGGE also found *L. fusiformis*, a new species previously detected in soy-based  
369 fermented foods (Chettri and Tamang, 2015), while LH-PCR and RT-LH-PCR detected other LAB, such as *Lc. lactis*, *E.*  
370 *faecalis* and *Str. thermophilus*. This microbial pattern was also confirmed by the high viable counts on LAB media  
371 (MRS and M17) and on enterococci selective media (SBA) on the order of 7-8 Log cfu g<sup>-1</sup>.

372 In feta cheese, *Lb. delbrueckii* was revealed by using DNA and RNA as target by both molecular techniques applied in  
373 this study. Six other LAB species, *Str. thermophilus*, *Lc. lactis*, *E. faecalis*, *Lb. helveticus*, *Lb. rhamnosus* and *P.*  
374 *acidilactici*, were also identified by LH-PCR and RT-LH-PCR and had high viable counts on selective media for LAB  
375 and specifically for enterococci (from 5.1 to 7.5 Log cfu g<sup>-1</sup>).

376 The microbiota of salami had different profiles from the two techniques. PCR-DGGE and RT-PCR-DGGE confirmed  
377 the presence of *St. saprophyticus*, *Lb. sakei* and *St. xylosus*, as frequently reported in the literature (Aquilanti et al.,  
378 2016). Intriguingly, high loads on the micrococcus- and staphylococcus-selective medium MSA were observed (7.2 ±  
379 0.04 Log cfu g<sup>-1</sup>). LH-PCR and RT-LH-PCR showed the dominance of *Lb. plantarum*, *P. acidilactici*, *Lb. fermentum*,  
380 *Lc. lactis*, *Str. thermophilus* and *E. faecalis*. High viable counts on LAB- and enterococcus-selective media (MRS, M17  
381 and SBA), ranging from 5.1 to 7.6 Log cfu g<sup>-1</sup>, were found.

382 In *burrata*, *Pseudomonas* sp. and *Ps. fragi* were detected by PCR-DGGE either by analyzing DNA or RNA, which was  
383 also supported by their viable counts on PAB on the order of 4 Log cfu g<sup>-1</sup>. *Lb. crispatus* was also identified by DNA-  
384 based PCR-DGGE. Thermophilic LAB, commonly used as starter cultures to produce high-moisture mozzarella cheese,  
385 such as *Str. thermophilus* and *Lb. helveticus* (De Angelis and Gobbetti, 2011), were detected only by LH-PCR and RT-  
386 LH-PCR. This finding is in agreement with high viable counts (> 5.0 Log cfu g<sup>-1</sup>) on M17 and MRS agar plates  
387 incubated at 42°C.

388 In table olives, chloroplast DNA of *Olea europaea* was found together with bacterial species ascribed to *Leuc.*  
389 *mesenteroides* and *Ac. johnsonii* by DNA-based PCR-DGGE. *Lb. plantarum*, *Br. cytisi*, *Ac. baumannii*, *Ps. fluorescens*,  
390 and *Sphingomonas* sp. were also found at the RNA level. No viable counts on PAB were found thus indicating that the  
391 rRNA from *Pseudomonas* could derive from VBNC or dormant or dead non-lysed cells. Similarly, *E. faecalis* was  
392 identified by RT-LH-PCR despite no growth was observed on enterococci selective media (SBA). Moreover, *Lb.*  
393 *fermentum*, *Lb. helveticus*, *Str. thermophilus* and *Lb. plantarum* were found by combination of LH-PCR and RT-LH-  
394 PCR in accordance with the results of the viable counts on LAB selective media (MRS and M17), ranging from 3.8 to  
395 3.9 Log cfu g<sup>-1</sup>.

396 Members of the genus *Acinetobacter* were also detected by PCR-DGGE (DNA and RNA) in pasteurized milk together  
397 with *Pseudomonas* sp., *U. oligocarboniphilum* and thermal-resistant spore-forming bacilli such as *A. flavithermus* and  
398 *Bacillus* sp. Again, there was no visible bacterial growth on PAB as previously observed for table olives. The only  
399 species identified by RT-LH-PCR was *Str. thermophilus*, as previously reported by Delgado and colleagues (2013).  
400 Despite the low viable counts on M17 agar at 42°C (2.3 Log ufc mL<sup>-1</sup>) RT-LH-PCR was able to detect *Str.*  
401 *thermophilus* showing a higher sensitivity of this method respect PCR-DGGE.

402 To our knowledge, a paucity of data are present in the literature concerning the microbiota of seaweeds. In the present  
403 study, although with a very low percentage of identity (78%), the closest relatives to *Lewinella* sp. were found in  
404 seaweeds through PCR-DGGE. Because species belonging to this genus are marine bacteria (Oh et al., 2009), it is  
405 possible to speculate that it is effectively present in this matrix. Furthermore, other species with environmental origin  
406 were found by using RT-PCR-DGGE. In detail, besides *B. smithii*, *C. aerophila* was isolated from a hot spring sulfur-  
407 turf in Japan (Sekiguchi et al., 2003), *S. acidophilus* was isolated from a hydrothermal vent in the Pacific Ocean (Li et  
408 al., 2011), and *Sphingobium* sp. comprises species generally isolated from soil (Singh and Lal, 2009). Despite low  
409 bacterial load found on MSA (2.0 Log cfu g<sup>-1</sup>) and on SBA (1.4 Log cfu g<sup>-1</sup>) *K. kristinae* was detected by DNA and  
410 RNA based LH-PCR, while *E. faecium* was identified only by DNA-based LH-PCR, thus confirming the high  
411 sensitivity of this technique. The presence of these species on seaweeds may be due to human contamination (*K.*  
412 *kristinae*) or could arise from aquatic habitats (*E. faecalis*) (Alexander et al., 2015).

413 Even if non bacterial growth was detected on *Pseudomonas* selective media (PAB) for cream cheese, this food sample  
414 was contaminated by *Pseudomonas* sp. and *Ps. fragi* at the DNA and RNA levels detected by using PCR-DGGE,  
415 together with *Leuc. mesenteroides* (DNA level), *Bradyrhizobium* sp. and *Cu. lanceolatus* (RNA level). *Str.*  
416 *thermophilus*, which is commonly used as starter to produce this type of cheese (Buriti et al., 2007), was the only  
417 species detected by DNA based LH-PCR. Despite the relatively high bacterial load of 3.8 Log cfu g<sup>-1</sup>, enumerated after  
418 growth on M17 agar at 42°C, the latter species was not identified by RNA based LH-PCR. This result could indicate the  
419 growth of other thermophilic LAB which could be identified after database enlargement since two unattributed peaks  
420 were detected at RT-LH-PCR.

421 Like cream cheese, butter was contaminated with spoilage bacteria, specifically *Ps. putida* and *Ps. reinekei*, at the DNA  
422 and RNA levels by using PCR-DGGE. Intriguingly, no viable cells were found on PAB, probably because  
423 *Pseudomonadaceae* species were present in their VBNC form or dormant or dead non-lysed cells. In contrast, low  
424 viable counts on VRBA (2.4 ± 0.05 Log cfu g<sup>-1</sup>) and VRBGA (2.3 ± 0.02 Log cfu g<sup>-1</sup>) were found, although  
425 *Enterobacteriaceae* were not identified with PCR-DGGE and LH-PCR. These results could be explained by the low  
426 detection limit of these techniques or by the limited LH-PCR database as some unattributed peaks that were detected  
427 could be related to *Enterobacteriaceae*.

428 The presence of chloroplast DNA of *Solanum lycopersicum* in tomatoes was detected by PCR-DGGE together with the  
429 viable contaminant *Staphylococcus* sp. although with sequence identity lower than 97%, while LH-PCR was not able to  
430 identify any bacterial species by using DNA or RNA as the target.

431 Overall, by comparing PCR-DGGE and LH-PCR results, some interesting evidences emerged. In contrast to PCR-  
432 DGGE, which allows the identification of the species by comparing the obtained sequences with a huge number of

433 sequences deposited in GenBank (<http://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/>), LH-PCR peaks identification is based, up to date, on  
434 a dairy database mainly composed by LAB species (Gatti et al., 2008; Lazzi et al., 2004). One of the intriguing results  
435 of this study is that the identification of unattributed LH-PCR peaks, could be solved by merging PCR-DGGE  
436 identification results. For instance, on the basis of the PCR-DGGE results, the unattributed 306-base-pair amplicon  
437 detected by LH-PCR in table olives, pasteurized milk, cream cheese, butter, burrata and soy sprouts could be  
438 hypothesized to be a member of the genus *Pseudomonas*. On the other hand, LH-PCR allowed the detection of some  
439 LAB and CCN species not identified by PCR-DGGE. This phenomenon was particularly evident in food samples with  
440 viable loads  $< 5.0 \text{ Log cfu g}^{-1}$ , specifically in pasteurized milk and seaweeds, thus suggesting the higher sensitivity of  
441 LH-PCR respect PCR-DGGE. In samples with viable bacterial loads  $> 5.0 \text{ Log cfu g}^{-1}$  (burrata, kefir, feta cheese and  
442 salami), instead, LAB species were generally also detected by PCR-DGGE. These findings were expected, as LAB are  
443 the dominant bacteria in these fermented foods. Discrepancies among LH-PCR and PCR-DGGE results in species  
444 identification could be due to different sensitivity of the techniques. For both these techniques, the available literature  
445 reports the ability to detect only the dominant species. In particular, a detection limit of 3 Log cfu per milliliter or per  
446 gram was found for PCR-DGGE (Cocolin et al., 2013) and approximately 4-5 Log cfu per milliliter or per gram was  
447 indicated for LH-PCR (Lazzi et al., 2004; Santarelli et al., 2013) although the detection limit for this latter method was  
448 defined only for milk and dairy products (Lazzi et al., 2004; Santarelli et al., 2013). However, this limit may vary  
449 depending on the complexity of the microbiota and of the nature of the food matrix (Cocolin et al., 2013; Ercolini et al.,  
450 2004). Furthermore, in the present study, LH-PCR was able to detect an higher number of fragments in the food  
451 matrices analyzed respect to the PCR-DGGE signals. This phenomenon could be explained by the fact that LH-PCR  
452 amplicons are separated through capillary electrophoresis, differently from PCR-DGGE that uses gel separation.  
453 Capillary electrophoresis has been reported to have higher sensitivity, resolution and discriminatory power compared to  
454 gel-based electrophoresis (Liljander et al., 2009; Beaubier et al., 2000). Moreover, DGGE bands from more than one  
455 species may comigrate which could result in underestimation of bacterial diversity (Heuer et al., 2001; Ercolini, 2004).  
456 Additionally, faint bands on the gel images may possibly be invisible to the eye and therefore remain undetected.  
457 Therefore, from all these considerations it is reasonable to suppose that in terms of sensitivity and resolution, the  
458 performance of LH-PCR could be greater than PCR-DDGE.

459

## 460 **5. Conclusions**

461

462 The efficiency of the two culture-independent methods PCR-DGGE and LH-PCR was compared by analyzing the  
463 bacterial ecology of 14 different foods (fermented and non fermented) using both DNA and RNA extracted directly

464 from food matrices as targets. Furthermore, the obtained results were compared with viable counts on different selective  
465 media chosen on the basis to cover the main bacterial groups presumptively present in tested food samples. Both  
466 culture-independent methods showed to be able to identify bacteria at species level fast and accurately without need of  
467 cultivation and isolation steps which are often laborious and time consuming. A generally good correlation was seen  
468 between the species identified by culture-independent methods and corresponding bacterial groups enumerated on eight  
469 different selective media (particularly evident for RNA-based PCR-DGGE and LH-PCR). For the majority of the  
470 samples, RT-PCR-DGGE revealed more species respect PCR-DGGE thus confirming the importance to use RNA as  
471 target instead of DNA to elucidate the food bacterial diversity. LH-PCR was able to identify several LAB and CCN  
472 species not detected by PCR-DGGE. This phenomenon was particularly evident in food samples with viable loads < 5.0  
473 Log cfu g<sup>-1</sup>, thus suggesting the higher sensitivity of LH-PCR respect to PCR-DGGE. Furthermore, if considering the  
474 number of detected peaks, LH-PCR showed again higher sensitivity when compared with PCR-DGGE method, but due  
475 to limited database based only on milk and dairy products, its main disadvantage remain the impossibility to identify  
476 those peaks. On the other hand, PCR-DGGE, a widely employed molecular technique in the food microbiology field  
477 allowed identification of some other species (LAB included) not identified by LH-PCR, hence some peaks  
478 corresponding to DNA or cDNA amplicons not identified by LH-PCR might probably be related to species identified by  
479 PCR-DGGE. As only partial overlapping of bacteria was found by using the two techniques, a combined use of LH-  
480 PCR and PCR-DGGE could be useful to describe accurately the food microbiota. The results of this study also showed  
481 that LH-PCR is a promising method for food microbiology, hence a further effort on LH-PCR database enlargement is  
482 recommended. This study also represents a contribution to the knowledge about the bacterial microbiota occurring in  
483 some foods that have been poorly investigated, such as seaweeds and soy-based products (tofu, soy “milk”, soy  
484 “yogurt”).

485

## 486 **References**

487

- 488 Alexander, J., Bollmann, A., Seitz, W., Schwartz, T., 2015 Microbiological characterization of aquatic microbiomes  
489 targeting taxonomical marker genes and antibiotic resistance genes of opportunistic bacteria. *Sci. Total Environ.*  
490 512–513, 316–325.
- 491 Altschul, S.F., Gish, W., Miller, W., Myers, E. W., Lipman, D.J., 1990. Basic local alignment search tool. *J. Mol. Biol.*  
492 215, 403-410.
- 493 Amann, R. I., Krumholz, L., Stahl, D. A., 1990. Fluorescent-oligonucleotide probing of whole cells for determinative,  
494 phylogenetic, and environmental studies in microbiology. *J. Bacteriol.* 172, 762-70.

495 American Public Health Association, 1978. Standard Methods for the Examination of Dairy Products. 14th Edn. APHA  
496 Inc. Washington DC.

497 Anbu, P., Noh, M.J., Kim, D.H., Seo, J.S., Hur, B.K., Min, K.H., 2011. Screening and optimization of extracellular  
498 lipases by *Acinetobacter* species isolated from oil-contaminated soil in South Korea. Afr. J. Biotechnol. 10,  
499 4147-4156.

500 [Aquilanti, L., Santarelli, S., Babini, V., Osimani, A., Garofalo, C., Poverigiani, S., Clementi, F., 2016a. PCR-DGGE  
501 for the profiling of cheese bacterial communities: strengths and weaknesses of a poorly explored combined  
502 approach. Dairy Sci. & Technol. DOI 10.1007/s13594-016-0296-z.](#)

503 Aquilanti, L., Garofalo, C., Osimani, A. and Clementi, F., 2016b. Ecology of lactic acid bacteria and coagulase negative  
504 cocci in fermented dry sausages manufactured in Italy and other Mediterranean. countries: an overview. Int. Food  
505 Res. J. 23, 429-445.

506 Aquilanti, L., Kahraman, O., Zannini, E., Osimani, A., Silvestri, G., Ciarrocchi, F., Garofalo, C., Tekin, E., Clementi,  
507 F., 2012. Response of lactic acid bacteria to milk fortification with dietary zinc salts. Int. Dairy J. 25, 52-59.

508 Bannerman, T.L., 2003. *Staphylococcus*, *Micrococcus* and other catalase-positive cocci that grow aerobically. In:  
509 Murray, P.R., Baron, E.J., Jorgensen, J.H., Pfaller, M.A., Tenover, R.H. (ed.). Manual of clinical microbiology, 8<sup>th</sup>  
510 ed. American Society for Microbiology, Washington, D.C.

511 Barco, L., Belluco, S., Roccato, A., Ricci, A., 2014. *Escherichia coli* and *Enterobacteriaceae* counts on poultry  
512 carcasses along slaughter processing line, factors influencing the counts and relationship between visual faecal  
513 contamination of carcasses and counts: a review. EFSA supporting publication 2014:EN-636, 107 pp.

514 [Beaubier, N.T., Hart, A.P., Bartolo, C., Willman, C.L., Viswanatha, D.S., 2000. Comparison of capillary  
515 electrophoresis and polyacrylamide gel electrophoresis for the evaluation of T and B cell clonality by polymerase  
516 chain reaction. Diagn. Mol. Pathol. 9\(3\), 121-31.](#)

517 Beasley, S., Tuoril, H., Saris, P.E.J., 2003. Fermented soymilk with a monoculture of *Lactococcus lactis*. Int. J. Food  
518 Microbiol. 81, 159– 162.

519 [Blazewicz, S.J., Barnard, R.L., Daly, R.A., Firestone M.K., 2013. Evaluating rRNA as an indicator of microbial activity  
520 in environmental communities: limitations and uses. The ISME Journal. 7, 2061-2068.](#)

521 Bleve, G., Rizzotti, L., Dellaglio, F., Torriani, S., 2003. Development of reverse transcription (RT)-PCR and real-time  
522 RT-PCR assays for rapid detection and quantification of viable yeasts and molds contaminating yoghurts and  
523 pasteurized food products. Appl. Environ. Microbio. 69, 4116-4122.

524 Botta, C., Cocolin L., 2012. Microbial dynamics and biodiversity in tableolivefermentation:culture-dependentand-  
525 independentapproaches. Front. Microbiol. 3, 245.

526 Bottari, B., Santarelli, M., Neviani, E., Gatti, M., 2010. Natural whey starter for Parmigiano Reggiano: culture-  
527 independent approach. *J. Appl. Microbiol.* 108, 1676-1684.

528 Brady, C.L., Venter, S.N., Cleenwerck, I., Engelbeen, K., Vancanneyt, M., Swings, J., Coutinho, T.A., 2009. *Pantoea*  
529 *vagans* sp. nov., *Pantoea eucalypti* sp. nov., *Pantoea deleyi* sp. nov. and *Pantoea anthophila* sp. nov. *Int. J. Syst.*  
530 *Evol. Microbiol.* 59, 2339–2345.

531 Brusetti, L., Borin, S., Mora, D., Rizzi, A., Raddadi, N., Sorlini, C., 2006. Usefulness of length heterogeneity-PCR for  
532 monitoring lactic acid bacteria succession during maize ensiling. *FEMS Microbiol. Ecol.* 56, 154-164.

533 Buriti, F.C.A, Cardarelli, H.R, Filisetti T., Saad, S., 2007. Synbiotic potential of fresh cream cheese supplemented with  
534 inulin and *Lactobacillus paracasei* in co-culture with *Streptococcus thermophilus*. *Food Chem.* 104, 1605–1610.

535 Chapman, G.H., 1945. The Significance of Sodium Chloride in Studies of Staphylococci. *J. Bacteriol.* 50, 201–203.

536 Chettri, R., Tamang, J.P. 2015. *Bacillus* species isolated from tungrymbai and bekgang, naturally fermented soybean  
537 foods of India. *Int. J. Food Microbiol.* 197, 72–76.

538 Cocolin, L., Alessandria, V., Dolci, P., Gorra, R., Rantsiou, K., 2013. Culture independent methods to assess the  
539 diversity and dynamics of microbiota during food fermentation. *Int. J. Food Microbiol.* 167, 29-43.

540 De Angelis, M., Gobbetti, M., 2011. Pasta-filata cheeses: traditional Pasta-filata cheese, in: J.W. Fuquay (Ed.),  
541 *Encyclopedia of Dairy Sciences* (2nd ed.)vol. 1, , Elsevier, New York, USA pp. 745–752.

542 De Man, J.C., Rogosa, M., Sharpe, M.E., 1960. A medium for the cultivation of lactobacilli. *J. Appl. Bact.* 23, 130-135.

543 D’Incecco, P., Gatti, M., Hogenboom, J.A., Bottari, B., Rosi, V., Neviani, E., Pellegrino, L., 2016. Lysozyme affects  
544 the microbial catabolism of free arginine in raw-milk hard cheeses. *Food Microbiol.* 57, 16-22.

545 Delgado, S., Rachid, C.T.C.C, Fernández,E., Rychlik,T., Alegría,A. Peixoto, R.S., Mayo, B., 2013. Diversity of  
546 thermophilic bacteria in raw, pasteurized and selectively-cultured milk, as assessed by culturing, PCR-DGGE  
547 and pyrosequencing. *Food Microbiol.* 36, 103-111.

548 Dolci, P., Zenato, S., Pramotton, R., Barmaz, A., Alessandria, V., Rantsiou, K., Cocolin, L., 2013. Cheese surface  
549 microbiota complexity: RT-PCR-DGGE, a tool for a detailed picture? *Int. J. Food Microbiol.* 162, 8–12.

550 Dolci, P., Alessandria, V., Rantsiou, K., Cocolin, L., 2015. Advanced methods for the identification, enumeration, and  
551 characterization of microorganisms in fermented foods In: *Advances in fermented foods and beverages:*  
552 *improving quality, technologies and health benefits.* Woodhead publishing series in food science, technology and  
553 nutrition. Editor Wilhelm Holzapfel, Eds. Elsevier, 2015.

554 Donnarumma, G., Molinaro, A., Cimini, D., De Castro, C., Valli, V., De Gregorio, V., De Rosa, M., Schiraldi, C., 2014.  
555 *Lactobacillus crispatus* L1: high cell density cultivation and exopolysaccharide structure characterization to  
556 highlight potentially beneficial effects against vaginal pathogens. *BMC Microbiol.* 14, 137.

557 Ercolini, D., 2004. PCR-DGGE fingerprinting: novel strategies for detection of microbes in food. *J. Microbiol. Methods*  
558 56, 297-314.

559 Ercolini, D., Moschetti, G., Blaiotta, G., Coppola, S., 2001. The potential of a polyphasic PCR–DGGE approach in  
560 evaluating microbial diversity of natural whey cultures for water-buffalo mozzarella cheese production: bias of  
561 culture-dependent and culture-independent analyses. *Syst. Appl. Microbiol.* 24, 610–617.

562 Farnworth, E.R., Mainville, I., Desjardins M.P., Gardner, N., Fliss, I., Champagne, C., 2007. Growth of probiotic  
563 bacteria and bifidobacteria in a soy “yoghurt” formulation. *Int. J. Food Microbiol.* 116, 174–181.

564 Feng, Z., Gao, W., Ren, D., Chena, X., Li, J., 2013. Evaluation of bacterial flora during the ripening of Kedongsufu, a  
565 typical Chinese traditional bacteria-fermented soy bean product. *J. Sci. Food Agric.* 93, 1471–1478.

566 Franzetti, L., Scarpellini, M., 2007. Characterisation of *Pseudomonas* spp. isolated from foods. *Ann. Microbiol.* 57, 39-  
567 47.

568 Garcia-Garcerà, M., Coscollà, M., Garcia-Etxebarria, K., Martín-Caballero, J., González-Candelas, F., Latorre, A.,  
569 Calafell, F., 2012. *Staphylococcus* prevails in the skin microbiota of long-term immunodeficient mice.  
570 *Environ. Microbiol.* 14, 2087-2098.

571 Garofalo, C., Osimani, A., Milanović, V., Taccari, M., Aquilanti, L., Clementi, F., 2015b. The occurrence of beer  
572 spoilage lactic acid bacteria in craft beer production. *J. Food Sci.* 80, M2845-M2852.

573 Garofalo, C., Osimani, A., Milanović, V., Aquilanti, L., De Filippis, F., Stellato, G., Di Mauro, S., Turchetti, B.,  
574 Buzzini, P., Ercolini, D., Clementi, F., 2015a. Bacteria and yeast microbiota in milk kefir grains from different  
575 Italian regions. *Food Microbiol.* 49, 123-133.

576 Garofalo, C., Silvestri, G., Aquilanti, L., Clementi, F., 2008. PCR-DGGE analysis of lactic acid bacteria and yeast  
577 dynamics during the production processes of three varieties of Panettone. *J. Appl. Microbiol.* 105, 243-254.

578 Gatti, M., De Dea Lindner, J., De Lorentiis, A., Bottari, B., Santarelli, M., Bernini, V., Neviani, E., 2008. Dynamics of  
579 whole and lysed bacterial cells during Parmigiano-Reggiano cheese production and ripening. *Appl. Environ.*  
580 *Microbiol.* 74, 6161–6167.

581 Gatti, M., Bottari, B., Lazzi, C., Neviani, E., Mucchetti, G., 2014. Invited Review: Microbial evolution in raw milk,  
582 long-ripened cheeses produced using undefined natural whey starters. *J. Dairy Sci.* 97, 573-591.

583 Grice, E.A., Kong, H.H., Renaud, G., Young, A. C., Bouffard, G.G., Blakesley, R.W., Wolfsberg, T.G., Turner M.L.,  
584 Segre, J. A., 2008. A diversity profile of the human skin microbiota. *Genome Res.* 18, 1043-1050.

585 Heuer, H., Wieland, J., Schönwälder, A., Gomes, N. C. M., Smalla, K., 2001. Bacterial community profiling using  
586 DGGE or TGGE analysis, in *Environmental Molecular Microbiology: Protocols and Applications*, ed.  
587 Rouchelle I. P., editor. (Wymondham: Horizon Scientific Press; ), 177–190.

588 Huys, G., Vanhoutte, T., Joossens, M., Mahious, A.S., De Brandt, E., Vermeire, S., Swings, J., 2008. Coamplification  
589 of eukaryotic DNA with 16S rRNA gene-based PCR primers: possible consequences for population  
590 fingerprinting of complex microbial communities. *Curr. Microbiol.* 56, 553–557.

591 Hurtado, A., Reguant, C., Bordons, A., Rozès, N., 2012) Lactic acid bacteria from fermented table olives. *Food*  
592 *Microbiol.* 31, 1-8.

593 Hynes, W.L., Ferretti, J.J., Gilmore, M.S., Segarra, R.A., 1992. PCR amplification of streptococcal DNA using crude  
594 cell lysates. *FEMS Microbiol. Lett.* 94, 139-142.

595 Lane D.J., 1991. 16S/23S rRNA sequencing. In: Stackebrandt E., Goodfellow M., editors. *Nucleic acid techniques in*  
596 *bacterial systematics*. Chichester, United Kingdom: John Wiley & Sons.

597 Lazzi, C., Rossetti, L., Zago, M., Neviani, E., Giraffa, G., 2004. Evaluation of bacterial communities belonging to  
598 natural whey starters for Grana Padano cheese by length heterogeneity-PCR. *J. Appl. Microbiol.* 96, 481–490.

599 Li, B., Chen, Y., Liu, Q., Hu, S., Chen, X., 2011. Complete genome analysis of *Sulfobacillus acidophilus* strain TPY,  
600 isolated from a hydrothermal vent in the Pacific Ocean. *J. Bacteriol.* 193, 5555–5556.

601 Liao, C.H., 2006. Part V, Spoilage bacteria, Chapter 19, *Pseudomonas* and related genera, In: *Food spoilage*  
602 *microorganisms*, Edited by Clive de W. Blackburn, CRC Press Boca Raton Boston New York Washington, DC. pp.  
603 507-530.

604 Liljander A., Wiklund, L., Falk, N., Kweku, M., Martensson, A., Felger, I., Färnert, A. Malar, J., 2009. Optimization  
605 and validation of multi-coloured capillary electrophoresis for genotyping of *Plasmodium falciparum* merozoite  
606 surface proteins (msp1 and 2). *Malar. J.* 8: 78.

607 Manolopoulou, E., Sarantinopoulos, P., Zoidou, E., Aktypis, A., Moschopoulou, E., Kandarakis, I., G., Anifantakis,  
608 E.M., 2003. Evolution of microbial populations during traditional Feta cheese manufacture and ripening. *Int. J.*  
609 *Food Microbiol.* 82, 153–161.

610 Marchesi, J.R., Sato, T., Weightman, A.J., Martin, T.A., Fry, J.C., Hiom, S.H., Wade, W.G., 1998. Design and  
611 evaluation of useful bacterium-specific PCR primers that amplify genes coding for bacterial 16S rRNA. *Appl.*  
612 *Environ. Microbiol.* 64,795–799.

613 Martorana, A., Alfonzo, A., Settanni, L., Corona, O., La Croce, F., Caruso, T., Moschetti, G., Francesca, N., 2016.  
614 Effect of the mechanical harvest of drupes on the quality characteristics of green fermented table olives. *J. Sci.*  
615 *Food Agric.* 96, 2004–2017.

616 Moreno, L.I., Mills, D., Fetscher, J., John-Williams, K., Meadows-Jantz, L., McCord B., 2011. The application of  
617 amplicon length heterogeneity PCR (LH-PCR) for monitoring the dynamics of soil microbial communities  
618 associated with cadaver decomposition. *J. Microbiol. Methods*, 84, 388-393.

619 Neviani, E., Bottari, B., Lazzi, C., Gatti, M., 2013b. New developments in the study of the microbiota of raw-milk,  
620 long-ripened cheeses by molecular methods: The case of Grana Padano and Parmigiano Reggiano. *Front.*  
621 *Microbiol.* 4, 36.

622 Oh, H.M., Lee, K., Cho, J.C., 2009. *Lewinella antarctica* sp. nov., a marine bacterium isolated from Antarctic seawater.  
623 *Int. J. Syst. Evol. Microbiol.* 59, 65–68.

624 Osimani, A., Garofalo, C., Aquilanti, L., Milanović, V., Clementi F., 2015. Unpasteurised commercial boza as a source  
625 of microbial diversity. *Int. J. Food Microbiol.* 194, 62-70.

626 Pogačić, T., Šinko, S., Zamberlin, Š., Samaržija, D., 2013. Microbiota of kefir grains. *Mljekarstvo* 63, 3-14.

627 Polychroniadou-Alichanidou, A., 2004. Part III: Solid Cultured Dairy Products. In: Hui, Y.H., Meunier- Goddik,L.,  
628 Solvejg Hansen, A., Josephsen, J., Nip, W.K., Stanfield, P.S., Toldrà, F. *Handbook of Food and Beverage*  
629 *Fermentation Technology.* CRC Press, New York.

630 Prado, M.R., Blandón, L.M.,Vandenberghe, L.P.S., Rodrigues, C., Castro, G.R., Thomaz-Soccol, V., Soccol, C.R. 2015.  
631 Milk kefir: composition, microbial cultures, biological activities, and related products. *Front Microbiol.* 6, 1177.

632 [Prosser, J., Jansson, J.K., Liu, Wen-Tso. 2010. Nucleic-acid-based characterization of community structure and function.](#)  
633 [In: Environmental Molecular Microbiology. Ed. by Wen-Tso Liu and Jansson J.K. Caister Academic Press.](#)  
634 [Norfolk, UK.](#)

635 Rantsiou, K., Urso, R., Dolci, P., Comi, G., Cocolin, L., 2008. Microflora of Feta cheese from four Greek  
636 manufacturers. *Int. J. Food Microbiol.* 126, 36–42.

637 Ricciardi, A., Guidone, A., Zotta, T., Matera, A., Claps, S., Parente, E., 2015. Evolution of microbial counts and  
638 chemical and physico-chemical parameters in high-moisture mozzarella cheese during refrigerated storage.  
639 *LWT-Food Sci. Technol.* 63, 821–827.

640 Rossetti, L., Fornasari, M.E., Gatti, M., Lazzi, C., Neviani, E., Giraffa. G., 2008. Grana Padano cheese whey starters:  
641 microbial composition and strain distribution. *Int. J. Food Microbiol.* 127, 168-171.

642 Santarelli, M., Gatti, M., Lazzi, C., Bernini, V., Zapparoli, G.A., Neviani, E., 2008. Whey starter for Grana Padano  
643 cheese: effect of technological parameters on viability and composition of the microbial community. *J. Dairy Sci.*  
644 91, 883–891.

645 Saw, J.H., Mountain, B.W., Feng, L., Omelchenko, M.V., Hou, .S, Saito, J.A., Stott, M.B., Li, D., Zhao, G., Wu, J.,  
646 Galperin, M.Y., Koonin, E.V., Makarova, K.S., Wolf, Y.I., Rigden, D.J., Dunfield, P.F., Wang, L., Alam, M.,  
647 2008. Encapsulated in silica: genome, proteome and physiology of the thermophilic bacterium *Anoxybacillus*  
648 *flavithermus*WK1. *Genome Biol.* 9, R161.

649 Sekiguchi, Y., Yamada, T., Hanada, S., Ohashi, A., Harada, H., Kamagata, Y., 2003. *Anaerolinea thermophila* gen.  
650 nov., sp. nov. and *Caldilinea aerophila* gen. nov., sp. nov., novel filamentous thermophiles that represent a  
651 previously uncultured lineage of the domain Bacteria at the subphylum level. *Int. J. Syst. Evol. Microbiol.* 53,  
652 1843–1851.

653 Server-Busson, C., Foucaud, C., Leveau, J.-Y., 1999. Selection of dairy *Leuconostoc* isolates for important technological  
654 properties. *J. Dairy Res.* 66, 245-256.

655 Singh, A., Lal, R., 2009. *Sphingobium ummariense* sp. nov., a hexachlorocyclohexane (HCH)-degrading bacterium,  
656 isolated from HCH-contaminated soil. *Int. J. Syst. Evol. Microbiol.* 59, 162–166.

657 Slanetz, L.W., Bartley, C.H., 1957. Numbers of enterococci in water, sewage, and feces determined by the membrane  
658 filter technique with an improved medium. *J. Bacteriol.* 74, 591-596.

659 Suzuki, M.T., Rappe, M.S., Giovannoni, S.J., 1998. Kinetic bias estimates of coastal picoplankton community structure  
660 obtained by measurements of small-subunit rRNA gene PCR amplicon length heterogeneity. *Appl. Environ.*  
661 *Microbiol.* 64, 4522–4529.

662 Terzaghi, B.E., Sandine, W.E., 1975. Improved medium for lactic streptococci and their bacteriophages. *Appl.*  
663 *Microbiol.* 29, 807-813.

664

665 **Figure captions**

666

667 **Fig. 1.** Bacterial DGGE profiles of the DNA (panel A) and RNA-cDNA (panel B) extracted directly from food samples  
668 and amplified with primers 63F<sub>GC</sub> and 355R. The bands indicated by the letters were excised, re-amplified and  
669 subjected to sequencing. The identification of the bands is reported in Table 1; “L” indicates Ladder composed of  
670 *Lactobacillus plantarum* DSMZ 2601 (1) and *Lactobacillus brevis* DSMZ 20556 (2).

671

672 **Fig. 2.** Examples of bacterial LH-PCR electropherogram profiles of the DNA (panel A) and RNA-cDNA (panel B)  
673 extracted directly from food samples (soy “milk” and feta cheese) and amplified with primers 63F and 355R. The X-  
674 axis shows peak sizes as base pairs (bp) and the Y-axis shows the peak intensity as relative fluorescence units. Some  
675 peaks sizes were attributed to bacterial species according to the LH-PCR published database (Lazzi et al., 2004; Gatti et  
676 al., 2008), as follows: *Streptococcus thermophilus* (318), *Lactococcus lactis* (319), *Enterococcus faecalis* (329),  
677 *Lactobacillus delbrueckii* (330), *Lactobacillus helveticus* (334), *Lactobacillus rhamnosus* (336, 290) and *Pedicoccus*  
678 *acidilactici* (345). The other peaks are unattributed.

679

680

681

682