



# UNIVERSITÀ DI PARMA

## ARCHIVIO DELLA RICERCA

University of Parma Research Repository

Speleothem record attests to stable environmental conditions during Neanderthal-modern human turnover in southern Italy

This is the peer reviewed version of the following article:

*Original*

Speleothem record attests to stable environmental conditions during Neanderthal-modern human turnover in southern Italy / Columbu, Andrea; Chiarini, Veronica; Spötl, Christoph; Benazzi, Stefano; Hellstrom, John; Cheng, Hai; De Waele, Jo. - In: NATURE ECOLOGY & EVOLUTION. - ISSN 2397-334X. - 4:9(2020), pp. 1188-1195. [10.1038/s41559-020-1243-1]

*Availability:*

This version is available at: 11381/2901534 since: 2021-12-15T16:16:17Z

*Publisher:*

*Published*

DOI:10.1038/s41559-020-1243-1

*Terms of use:*

Anyone can freely access the full text of works made available as "Open Access". Works made available

*Publisher copyright*

note finali coverpage

(Article begins on next page)

1 **Speleothem record attests stable environmental conditions during**  
2 **Neanderthal-Modern Human turnover in Southern Italy**

3

4 Columbu Andrea<sup>1\*</sup>, Chiarini Veronica<sup>1</sup>, Spötl Christoph<sup>2</sup>, Benazzi Stefano<sup>3,4</sup>,  
5 Hellstrom John<sup>5</sup>, Cheng Hai<sup>6,7,8</sup>, De Waele Jo<sup>1</sup>

6

7 1) University of Bologna, Department of Biological Geological and Environmental  
8 Sciences (Bologna, Italy)

9 2) University of Innsbruck, Institute of Geology (Innsbruck, Austria)

10 3) University of Bologna, Department of Cultural Heritage (Bologna, Italy)

11 4) Max Planck Institute for Evolutionary Anthropology, Department of Human  
12 Evolution (Leipzig, Germany)

13 5) University of Melbourne, School of Earth Sciences (Melbourne Australia)

14 6) Xi'an Jiaotong University, Institute of Global Environmental Change (Xi'an,  
15 China)

16 7) State Key Laboratory of Loess and Quaternary Geology, Institute of Earth  
17 Environment, Chinese Academy of Sciences, Xi'an (Xi'an, China)

18 8) University of Minnesota, Department of Earth Sciences (Minnesota, USA)

19 \* corresponding author

20

21 **The causes of Neanderthal-Modern Human (MH) turnover are ambiguous.**  
22 **While potential biocultural interactions between the two groups are still**  
23 **little known, it is clear that Neanderthals in southern Europe disappeared**  
24 **about 42,000 years ago (ka), after ~3,000 years long cohabitation with MH.**  
25 **Among a plethora of hypotheses on Neanderthal extinction, rapid climate**  
26 **changes during the Middle to Upper Palaeolithic transition (MUPT) are**  
27 **regarded as a primary factor. Here we show evidence for stable climate and**  
28 **environmental conditions during the MUPT in a region (Apulia) where**  
29 **Neanderthals and MH coexisted. We base our findings on a rare last glacial**  
30 **stalagmite deposited between ~106 and ~27 ka, providing the first**  
31 **continuous western Mediterranean speleothem palaeoclimate archive for**  
32 **this period. The uninterrupted growth of the stalagmite attests the**  
33 **constant availability of rainfall and vegetated soils, while its  $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ - $\delta^{18}\text{O}$**

34 **palaeoclimate proxies demonstrate that Apulia was not affected by**  
35 **dramatic climate oscillations during the MUPT. Our results imply that**  
36 **climate did not play a key role in the disappearance of the Neanderthals in**  
37 **this area, thus the Neanderthal-MH turnover must be approached from a**  
38 **perspective that takes into account climate and environmental conditions**  
39 **favourable for both species.**

40

#### 41 **Background**

42 There is no leading theory about the triggers of the most important cultural  
43 transition in human history<sup>1,2</sup>. Rapid climate shifts during the MUPT are  
44 considered as one of the most important drivers of the Neanderthal-MH  
45 interchange<sup>2-8</sup>, because of the impact on population/depopulation dynamics<sup>7,8</sup>,  
46 fragmentation of optimal habitats<sup>6</sup>, deterioration of environmental conditions<sup>3</sup>,  
47 and/or the weakening of local communities after severe cold and dry stages<sup>4</sup>.  
48 Accordingly, the Neanderthals have been inexorably afflicted by recurrent  
49 millennial- to centennial-scale dry and cold conditions attributable to  
50 Dansgaard–Oeschger (DO) cycles and especially Heinrich (H) events during  
51 Marine Isotope Stage (MIS) 3. H events induced aridity and cold temperatures in  
52 Western and Central Europe<sup>10</sup>, and those occurring from ~63 to ~40.5 ka (H6 to  
53 H4) had irreversible impacts on the Neanderthal population<sup>5</sup>. The one at ~40.5  
54 ka (H4) caused the final Neanderthals' demise and/or their migration into other  
55 areas where the extinction occurred later<sup>2</sup>. However, this is at odds with the fact  
56 that H events lack consistent equivalents in the Mediterranean realm<sup>11</sup> and they  
57 may have not necessarily resulted in very harsh climate conditions in the entire  
58 region<sup>12</sup>. Additionally, Neanderthal extinction might have occurred before H4<sup>13</sup>.  
59 Indeed, there are chronological and spatial impediments in solving this  
60 conundrum, because of age uncertainties of both the palaeoclimate and the  
61 anthropological events, and the unknown response of local Neanderthal-MH  
62 habitats to high-latitude driven climate change. Moreover, ancient human  
63 communities occupied only small portions of land with ideal settlement  
64 conditions, and the gradual climate deterioration of the last glacial period likely  
65 reduced the extent of these optimal Neanderthal habitats<sup>6</sup>. The 2,600 to 5,400  
66 years-long interval of Neanderthal-MH coexistence was likely unevenly

67 distributed in space<sup>13</sup>. Therefore, climate-related hypotheses should be based on  
68 records from the same area where Neanderthals-MH actually cohabitated, but  
69 these records are scarce<sup>14</sup>.

70 Neanderthal and MH remains are widespread from northern to southern Italy<sup>9</sup>.  
71 This study targets Apulia (Fig. 1), where Neanderthals were present since at  
72 least MIS 5e until ~42 ka, while the earliest European MH appeared in this  
73 region ~45 ka<sup>1,9</sup>. Thus, this is a strategic region for understanding the biocultural  
74 processes occurring during the Neanderthal-MH transition and, ultimately,  
75 whether climate played a decisive role in the disappearance of the former and in  
76 the territorial supremacy of the latter.

77

## 78 **Results**

79 We explored several caves in Apulia searching for speleothems (Extended Data  
80 Figure 1). Uranium-thorium (U-Th) radiometric dating on 14 stalagmites  
81 (Extended Data Figure 5 and Supplementary Table 1) attests that cave calcite  
82 deposition was abundant during the last and older glacial periods (Fig. 1). Here  
83 we focus on stalagmite PC from Pozzo Cucù Cave (40.90° N, 17.16° E), for which  
84 27 stratigraphically aligned U-Th dates (Supplementary Table 1) were used to  
85 produce an age-depth model (Extended Data Figure 6). Accordingly, PC grew  
86 uninterruptedly from 106.0 <sup>+2.8</sup>/<sub>-2.7</sub> to 26.6 <sup>+0.8</sup>/<sub>-0.9</sub> ka, and thus covers MIS 5 to  
87 MIS 3 (Fig. 2). High-resolution  $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ - $\delta^{13}\text{C}$  analyses (n = 2659) reveal a pattern  
88 comparable to the North Greenland Ice Core<sup>15</sup> (NGRIP) from the entire MIS 5 and  
89 4. During MIS 3,  $\delta^{18}\text{O}$  shows a less evident – but still recognisable – similarity  
90 with NGRIP, while  $\delta^{13}\text{C}$  yields a plateau-like signal. Importantly,  $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ - $\delta^{13}\text{C}$  does  
91 not show evidence of many of the most severe climate events affecting northern  
92 latitudes (e.g., Heinrich events).

93

## 94 **Discussion**

95 Because glacial stages in the Mediterranean area were generally dry and  
96 characterised by sparse vegetation, continuous speleothem growth was rare. In  
97 Italy, for example, there is no evidence of uninterrupted stalagmite deposition  
98 during glacial periods (Fig. 1). To our knowledge, the longest record has been  
99 constructed by using four speleothems (two stalagmites and two stalactites)

100 found in Frassassi Cave<sup>16</sup>. In the Iberian Peninsula, speleothem formation was  
101 also intermittent<sup>11,17,18</sup>, while more continuous deposition is only known from  
102 caves in Turkey and on the south-eastern side of the Mediterranean Sea<sup>19,20</sup>. The  
103 continuous growth of speleothems in Manot Cave (Israel) has been recently  
104 taken as evidence for the lack of water shortage in northern Israel during the last  
105 glacial period<sup>21</sup>. Considering that continuous speleothem deposition is only  
106 feasible if the karst reservoir is recharged by rainfall and soil bioactivity  
107 procures high amounts of CO<sub>2</sub> to infiltrating water, Apulia's glacial climate was  
108 possibly milder than in other areas in the western and central Mediterranean.  
109 The  $\delta^{13}\text{C}$  values of PC are representative of soil activity<sup>10,11</sup> (see methods). For  
110 most of the time, values are more negative than -5.0 ‰ (Fig. 2), attesting the  
111 presence of C3 plants<sup>22</sup> that normally prevail in temperate regions.  
112 It is well established that  $\delta^{18}\text{O}$  in speleothems from the Mediterranean  
113 principally reflects rainfall amount variations<sup>23</sup>. Secondly, it might also record  
114 changes in moisture sources<sup>24</sup>. Because of the striking resemblance between PC-  
115  $\delta^{18}\text{O}$  and NGRIP  $\delta^{18}\text{O}$  (Fig. 2), especially during MIS 5 and 4, we are confident  
116 that the stalagmite recorded the effects of climate change in the high latitudes  
117 and the North Atlantic. This intrahemispheric connection is translated into  
118 rainfall oscillations during DO cycles, with higher (lower) rainfall amount during  
119 interstadials (stadials) as expressed by more negative (positive)  $\delta^{18}\text{O}$  values.  
120 This correlation can also be seen at the intra-stadial/interstadial timescale<sup>25</sup>  
121 (Extended Data Figure 2). Intriguingly, the shape of several MIS 5 DO-like events  
122 in PC (e.g., DOs from ~90 to ~70 ka) appear more similar to the Asian monsoonal  
123 oscillations<sup>26</sup> than to NGRIP (Extended Data Figure 3), a feature worth to be  
124 examined in detail in future studies. Variability of PC growth rate and  $[\text{}^{234}\text{U}/\text{}^{238}\text{U}]_i$   
125 (Extended Data Figure 4) agrees with PC- $\delta^{18}\text{O}$  being principally driven by rainfall  
126 amount (see methods). Changes in the dominant moisture source are possibly  
127 reflected by the PC- $\delta^{18}\text{O}$  values too. During Greenland Interstadials (GIs) rainfall  
128 in the Mediterranean region was predominantly Atlantic-sourced giving rise to  
129 more negative  $\delta^{18}\text{O}$  values, similar to today<sup>23,27</sup>. Conversely, Mediterranean-  
130 sourced moisture showing more positive  $\delta^{18}\text{O}$  values prevailed when large ice  
131 sheets during Greenland Stadials (GSs) impeded the Westerlies from efficiently  
132 delivering moisture to the Mediterranean region (see methods). This is because

133 the lower moisture production in the Atlantic, according to the relative decrease  
134 of GSs temperatures, limits advection over the Mediterranean<sup>23</sup>. As the Atlantic  
135 moisture input decreases, the ratio between Mediterranean/Atlantic moisture  
136 increases in the area of study. The further expansion of northern ice-sheet since  
137 MIS 3 probably caused a pronounced southward shift of the Westerlies<sup>24</sup>, that  
138 might have boosted this mechanism.

139 The covariation of  $\delta^{18}\text{O}$  and  $\delta^{13}\text{C}$  in PC is consistent with rainfall amount being a  
140 primary driver (Fig. 2). In Apulia, rainfall coupled with temperature variations as  
141 recorded by other archives (Fig. 3) modulated soil organic activity reflected by  
142 the  $\delta^{13}\text{C}$  record of PC (Fig. 2). Between DO 24 and DO 15, bioproductivity  
143 increased during GIs giving rise to more negative  $\delta^{13}\text{C}$  values. Because of reduced  
144 rainfall and lower temperatures during GSs, bioproductivity decreased resulting  
145 in more positive  $\delta^{13}\text{C}$  values. The generally low  $\delta^{13}\text{C}$  values in conjunction with  
146 the lack of growth stops in PC strongly argues for a continuously vegetated  
147 catchment of the cave's drip water with expanding forests during GIs and trees  
148 becoming sparse during GSs (Fig. 3), in agreement with nearby pollen  
149 records<sup>28,29</sup>. The PC  $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ - $\delta^{13}\text{C}$  data suggest two periods of extremely dry  
150 condition, when both isotopes show peak values: from  $66.7^{+0.9}/_{-1.2}$  to  $65.6^{+1.1}/_{-1.3}$   
151 ka during MIS 4, and from  $55.3^{+1.1}/_{-2.5}$  to  $54.9^{+1.1}/_{-2.7}$  ka during MIS 3. Both  
152 events deviate from the NGRIP variability but agree with speleothem<sup>11</sup>,  
153 lacustrine<sup>29</sup> and marine records<sup>30</sup> from the Mediterranean region. They have  
154 been attributed to markedly dry conditions during ice-rafting events and  
155 increases of cold-water foraminifera in the North Atlantic during H events 6 and  
156 5a<sup>11,31</sup>. Although the aridity of these events was not sufficient to stop carbonate  
157 deposition at the PC site, as occurring in speleothems from continental Europe<sup>10</sup>  
158 (Fig. 3g), these periods are here regarded as the driest and probably coldest of  
159 the entire MIS 5 to 3 timespan at least in Southern Italy. The event at  $\sim 55$  ka was  
160 certainly the driest of the entire record as reflected by the highest  $\delta^{13}\text{C}$  values  
161 and a marked reduction in growth rate (Fig. 1 and Extended Data 4). This event  
162 was likely even drier than GS24 and GS23, from  $105.2^{+2.4}/_{-2.3}$  to  $102.4^{+2.1}/_{-2.0}$  ka  
163 and from  $95.7^{+0.9}/_{-0.8}$  to  $93.1^{+0.7}/_{-0.9}$  ka, which also led to  $\delta^{13}\text{C}$  values higher than  
164  $-5$  ‰.

165 There is no correlation between PC- $\delta^{18}\text{O}$  and NGRIP for DO 14 and 13 (Fig. 2),  
166 likely because of the low resolution due to the slow growth rate. From DO 12 to  
167 the top of the record, PC shows its most interesting features: i) PC- $\delta^{18}\text{O}$  reveals  
168 NGRIP-like millennial-scale oscillations, although the similarities with NGRIP are  
169 strikingly less evident than prior to  $\sim 55$  ka. The implication is that rapid climate  
170 oscillation during MIS 3 recorded in Greenland had a lower impact on rainfall  
171 variability in Apulia than those during MIS 5 and 4; and ii) these oscillations are  
172 superimposed to a general PC- $\delta^{18}\text{O}$  trend toward more positive values (Fig. 2),  
173 which is synchronous with the progressive reduction of the stalagmite's  
174 diameter (Fig. 1). Considering that the latter mirrors long-lasting reduced  
175 dripping and thus calcite deposition at the top of the speleothem<sup>32</sup>, these  
176 observations point to a middle to upper MIS 3 in Apulia characterised by a  
177 progressive rainfall reduction rather than by rapid and severe climate switches.  
178 At this point the Mediterranean might have become the primary source of  
179 moisture because of the expansion of the Northern ice-sheets. This is consistent  
180 with a gradual increase in the  $\delta^{18}\text{O}$  value of the moisture source for PC.  
181 Furthermore, rainfall amount variability during MIS 3 GIs and GSs, caused by  
182 Mediterranean cyclogenesis, is not comparable to that induced by a higher  
183 efficiency of Westerlies delivering moisture during MIS 4 and 5. This is because  
184 the availability of moisture is lower than when the Atlantic is the principal  
185 moisture source. Most importantly, from  $\sim 55$  ka onward PC  $\delta^{13}\text{C}$  values show a  
186 "plateau-like" feature during MIS 3 (Fig. 2). This cannot be explained by in-karst  
187 processes and/or kinetic mechanisms affecting isotopic fractionation (see  
188 methods), but rather reflects stable soil dynamics and only minor vegetation  
189 changes. Preliminary  $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ - $\delta^{13}\text{C}$  data from another Apulian stalagmite (SA1, Fig. 2  
190 and Extended Data 5) agree with PC<sup>33</sup>. This reinforces the idea that drastic  
191 rainfall (and temperature) variations were minimal and insufficient to cause  
192 major changes in soil bioproductivity and/or interruptions in speleothem  
193 deposition. Speleothems from Frasassi cave<sup>16</sup>, the only Italian record available  
194 for comparison (Fig. 1), also report  $\sim$ constant  $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ - $\delta^{13}\text{C}$  (Fig. 3) from  $\sim 55$  ka to  
195 at least  $\sim 30$  ka, which was interpreted as mirroring relatively stable climatic  
196 conditions in the northeastern Apennines. The slight depletion trend that is  
197 visible in the PC- $\delta^{13}\text{C}$  plateau may appear inconsistent with the gradual decrease

198 in rainfall expressed by PC- $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ . We advance the possibility that the lack of  
199 severe droughts, which would also cause the total/partial soil erosion, allowed  
200 an enduring maturation of pedogenic layers although the general trend of  
201 climate deterioration. This hypothesis will be thoroughly explored by future  
202 studies. Vegetation shifts likely occurred, but they were possibly less  
203 pronounced than in the nearby Monticchio Lake<sup>28</sup> area (Fig. 3) because of the  
204 proximity with the coast and the lower altitude.

205 Accordingly, from ~55 ka onward we set the beginning of environmental niche  
206 conditions in Apulia<sup>1</sup>. Neanderthals settled in this region well before MIS 3, so  
207 Apulia cannot be considered a *refugia*<sup>34</sup> for them. Contrarily to Apulia,  
208 freshwater availability, as well as vegetation, was scarce in the northern parts of  
209 the Italian Peninsula as highlighted by speleothem deposition (Fig. 1). This  
210 attracted wildlife and new hunter-gatherer communities.

211 Favourable settlement conditions might have fostered the arrival of MH in Apulia  
212 and their coexistence with Neanderthals (Fig. 2). The disappearance of  
213 Neanderthals in Apulia (~42 ka) occurred ~13,000 years after the cold and dry  
214 interval at ~55 ka, while the following H5 (~45 ka) apparently did not have a  
215 strong impact on the local environment. This is confirmed by arboreal pollen  
216 values above 40% in the nearby Monticchio Lake record<sup>28</sup>. In contrast, pollen in  
217 Greece<sup>29</sup>, planktonic foraminifera in the Tyrrhenian Sea<sup>30</sup> and speleothems from  
218 Iberia<sup>11</sup> and Turkey<sup>19</sup> record climate deterioration during H5 at around 48 ka  
219 (Fig. 3), further suggesting that Apulia was a favourable environmental niche  
220 during MIS 3 in comparison to other localities. It has been recently shown<sup>35</sup> that  
221 the climate in Morocco responded inconsistently to northern high-latitude ice-  
222 rafted debris events, with even pluvial phases occurring during these cold and  
223 dry periods. This calls for a re-evaluation of the role of the northern high  
224 latitudes in triggering major cooling/drying events across the Mediterranean  
225 region. Even supposing a late Neanderthal presence in Southern Italy, e.g. later  
226 than ~42 ka, the fact that the impact of H4 (~40.5 ka) on PC's proxy data is  
227 negligible further excludes climate as the major trigger for the Neanderthal-MH  
228 turnover during MUPT.

229

230 **Final remarks**

231 PC represents strong evidence of environmental stability in Apulia during the  
232 Neanderthal-MH turnover, hence high latitude rapid climate changes were not  
233 the primary cause of Neanderthals' disappearance in this region. Opposite  
234 opinions face the paradox that shifts toward a dry and cold climate did not result  
235 in a cessation of speleothem deposition, but caused the extinction of a species  
236 well adapted to the surrounding environment and that survived previous climate  
237 periods more severe than MIS 3. Consequently, this applies to all European mid-  
238 latitude regions where DO climate variations during MIS 3 were attenuated by  
239 latitudinal, orographic and/or geographical factors. In all Apulia-like niches, the  
240 issue of the Neanderthal-MH turnover must be approached from a perspective  
241 that takes into account climate and environmental conditions favourable for  
242 both species. This interestingly differs from the Levantine area where there was  
243 no water shortage during MUPT, but speleothem  $\delta^{13}\text{C}$  suggest an alternation  
244 between woody and more open vegetation. The adaptation of different modern  
245 cultures that possibly interacted with Neanderthals has been there defined as  
246 landscape-dependent<sup>21</sup>. In Apulia-like niches instead, the advanced hunting  
247 technology of MH groups over Neanderthals since their migration to Europe<sup>36-39</sup>  
248 appears now a solid reason to explain the territorial supremacy of the former  
249 that induced the extinction of the latter after ~3000 years of coexistence.  
250

251 **Methods**

252 **Cave sampling and speleothem subsampling**

253 The caves explored for this work are: Pozzo Cucù (40.90° N, 17.16° E), Trullo  
254 (40.85° N, 17.11° E), Sant'Angelo (40.73° N, 17.57° E) and Zaccaria (40.74° N,  
255 17.55° E) (Extended Data Figure 1). For the conservation of the cave  
256 environment, all speleothems used in this study were found displaced from their  
257 original position, sometimes in multiple pieces. No hammer or any cutting tools  
258 were employed during sampling. PC stalagmite was found right next to its  
259 growing location. All stalagmites were cut along the central axis and polished to  
260 allow a better visualization of the internal layering and macrofabrics. For U-Th  
261 dating, ~100 mg calcite powders and/or chips were obtained by milling along a  
262 discrete number of growth layers. Drill bits of 1 mm and 0.8 mm were used for  
263 preliminary and detailed dating, respectively. For stable isotope subsampling,  
264 one half of PC was quartered, in order to precisely conduct milling operation  
265 along the central axis. The milling increment was 0.1 mm between the top and 51  
266 mm from the top, and 0.2 mm from 51 mm to the bottom of the stalagmite. A  
267 total of 2659 subsamples was obtained. See Fig. 1 for subsampling location. The  
268 milling resulted in an average resolution of ~30 yr (range ~20 to 175 yr).

269

270 **U-Th dating and  $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ - $\delta^{18}\text{O}$  analyses**

271 The majority of U-Th dating was accomplished at the University of Melbourne  
272 (Australia), School of Earth Sciences, while a minor part was carried out at the  
273 Xi'an Jiaotong University (China), Institute of Global Environmental Change  
274 (Supplementary Table 1). In Melbourne, ~100 mg of calcite were first dissolved  
275 using  $\text{HNO}_3$  then spiked with a solution of a known  $^{236}\text{U}/^{233}\text{U}/^{229}\text{Th}$  ratio.  
276 Eichrom TRU-Spec resin columns were first decontaminated by using a  
277 sequential wash of 1.5M  $\text{HNO}_3$ , 4M  $\text{HCl}$  and 0.2M  $\text{HF}$ -0.1M  $\text{HCl}$ , then the U+Th  
278 compound was separated from the carbonate matrix by using another wash of  
279 1.5M  $\text{HNO}_3$ , 4M  $\text{HCl}$  and 0.2M  $\text{HF}$ -0.1M  $\text{HCl}$ . The U+Th solution evaporated on a  
280 hot plate at 80°C and later in 5%  $\text{HNO}_3$ -0.5%  $\text{HF}$ , to be ready for the analyses in a  
281 Nu Plasma multi-collector-inductively coupled plasma-mass spectrometer (MC-  
282 ICP-MS), with settings defined in previous works<sup>40</sup>. Final U-Th ages were  
283 calculated using equation (1) of Hellstrom (2006)<sup>41</sup> using the  $^{230}\text{Th}$ - $^{234}\text{U}$  decay  
284 constants of Cheng et al. (2013)<sup>42</sup> and an initial  $(^{230}\text{Th}/^{232}\text{Th})_i$  of  $1.5 \pm 1.5$ .  
285 In Xi'an, the general chemical preparation procedure is similar to Melbourne,  
286 although U and Th compounds, after calcite  $\text{HNO}_3$  dissolution, are first  
287 precipitated using a Fe solution, then extracted separately by using  
288 decontaminated resin columns and sequential washes of 6N  $\text{HCl}$  and ultraclean  
289 water. The U and Th solution is mixed with 2%  $\text{HNO}_3$  + 0.1%  $\text{HF}$  before analysis  
290 on a Thermo Fisher Neptune Plus MC-ICP-MS<sup>42</sup>. Ages were calculated as above.  
291 All ages are reported relative to 1950 AD (before present, BP; Supplementary  
292 Table 1). Despite slight differences in sample chemical treatment and age  
293 calculation, the dates produced in the two labs are consistent (Supplementary  
294 Table 1). Only top and bottom were dated for the majority of speleothems  
295 (Extended Data Figure 5), while 27 ages constitute the PC chronological dataset.  
296 The PC ages and their  $2\sigma$  uncertainties were used in StalAge<sup>43</sup> and COPRA<sup>44</sup> to  
297 produce the age model. Both algorithms produced a comparable age-depth curve  
298 (Extended Data Figure 6). In order to minimise the intrinsic artefacts produced  
299 by the two algorithms, such as unrealistic maxima in growth rate and unjustified

300 large uncertainty propagation, the final age model was obtained by a linear  
301 regression of the average age values between StalAge and COPRA models at the  
302 same depths (Extended Data Figure 6).

303 For stable isotopes, powders were prepared using an online, continuous-flow  
304 preparation system (GasBench II), then analysed using a ThermoFisher Delta V  
305 Plus mass spectrometer at the University of Innsbruck (Austria), Institute of  
306 Geology. NBS18, NBS19, CO1, and CO8 standards were used as references. The  
307 results are expressed in per mil (‰) units relative to the Vienna Pee Dee  
308 Belemnite (VPDB) international standard. The  $1\sigma$  analytical reproducibility was  
309 0.06‰ and 0.08‰ for  $\delta^{13}\text{C}$  and  $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ , respectively.

310

### 311 **Conditions during PC deposition**

312 Stable isotope values of speleothems deposited under non-equilibrium  
313 conditions may mask the palaeoclimate signal. The Hendy test can be used to  
314 evaluate geochemical conditions during calcite deposition<sup>45</sup>, and equilibrium is  
315 indicated if: 1)  $\delta^{13}\text{C}$  and  $\delta^{18}\text{O}$  values are not strongly correlated along the growth  
316 axis; 2)  $\delta^{13}\text{C}$  and  $\delta^{18}\text{O}$  values are not strongly positively correlated from the  
317 centre to the flank along individual growth layers; 3)  $\delta^{13}\text{C}$  and  $\delta^{18}\text{O}$  do not  
318 increase from the centre to the side of growth layer, with a maximum increase  
319 threshold of 0.8‰ for  $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ .  $\delta^{13}\text{C}$  and  $\delta^{18}\text{O}$  values along the central axis of PC are  
320 not strongly correlated ( $r = 0.6$  – although correlation itself might be a result of  
321 climate forcing<sup>46</sup>), and individual layers do not suggest non-equilibrium  
322 fractionation (Extended Data Figure 7). A slight influence of kinetic fractionation  
323 is only likely for the H1 layer (Extended Data Figure 7), located close to the top of  
324 the speleothem and starting at 10 mm from the centre of the stalagmite. In this  
325 top part, the stalagmite diameter is small, and the more positive  $\delta^{18}\text{O}$  values  
326 resulted from the steep flank.

327 In addition to the Hendy test, the constant  $\sim 10$  cm diameter of PC also argues in  
328 favour of equilibrium-dominated isotope fractionation<sup>47</sup>.

329 Finally, we consider Pozzo Cucù cave a ventilation-poor environment during PC  
330 deposition, considering the present narrow artificial entrance. Indeed, Pozzo  
331 Cucù possibly belongs to a karst system that had no large natural connection  
332 with the surface, minimizing the air exchange between the cave and the surface.  
333 This is important because ventilation is the main driver of fast degassing and  
334 evaporation in caves (considering that humidity in non-ventilated caves is  
335 commonly close to condensation), with evaporation being one of the principal  
336 causes of kinetic fractionation. However, it is suspected that speleothems are  
337 never deposited at full equilibrium conditions<sup>46</sup>, and we cannot exclude a small  
338 influence of kinetic fractionation in the PC stable isotope signature. For this  
339 reason, and based on our previous studies<sup>27,48,49</sup>, PC is considered as deposited  
340 under quasi-equilibrium conditions, i.e.  $\delta^{13}\text{C}$  and  $\delta^{18}\text{O}$  data primarily reflect  
341 palaeoclimate/palaeoenvironmental conditions above the cave.

342 Regarding post-depositional processes that might have compromised the  
343 original geochemical composition of the stalagmite, PC does not show any visual  
344 evidence of dissolution and recrystallization. Accordingly, all U-Th dates are in  
345 stratigraphic order (Supplementary Table 1).

346

### 347 **Significance of $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ and $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ values**

348 Speleothem  $\delta^{13}\text{C}$  and  $\delta^{18}\text{O}$  ( $\delta^{13}\text{C}_{\text{spel}}$  and  $\delta^{18}\text{O}_{\text{spel}}$ ) values reflect processes *inside*  
349 and *outside* of the karst system. Because endogenous (i.e. geological) processes  
350 might conceal and/or modify the geochemical output of exogenous (i.e. climatic)  
351 processes, the first challenge in speleothem science is to understand whether or  
352 not a potential climate signal has been registered in the stalagmite stable isotope  
353 signature. With calcite deposited under quasi-equilibrium conditions and with  
354 no evidence of diagenesis, endogenous factors can be ruled out as primary  
355 drivers of stable isotopic composition. Furthermore, considering that most of  
356 PC's  $\delta^{13}\text{C}$  and  $\delta^{18}\text{O}$  ( $\delta^{13}\text{C}_{\text{PC}}$  and  $\delta^{18}\text{O}_{\text{PC}}$ ) shifts occurred simultaneously with  
357 interhemispheric climate events (Fig. 2 and 3), it is clear that climate had a major  
358 role in modulating stable isotopes. The interpretation of  $\delta^{13}\text{C}_{\text{PC}}$  and  $\delta^{18}\text{O}_{\text{PC}}$   
359 timeseries hence requires to identify the key exogenous factor(s) and to  
360 understand if endogenous factors had a secondary role in modulating  $\delta^{13}\text{C}_{\text{PC}}$  and  
361  $\delta^{18}\text{O}_{\text{PC}}$  values.

362 At Western Europe latitudes, temperature and rainfall amount compete in  
363 regulating rainfall water  $\delta^{18}\text{O}$  ( $\delta^{18}\text{O}_{\text{rw}}$ ). Temperature and  $\delta^{18}\text{O}_{\text{rw}}$ , in the  
364 Mediterranean region, show a weak positive gradient of  $\sim 0.22\text{‰}/\text{°C}$ , while  
365 rainfall amount and  $\delta^{18}\text{O}_{\text{rw}}$  show a strong negative gradient of  $\sim -1.6\text{‰}/100\text{ mm}$   
366 rain<sup>50</sup>. The equilibrium  $\delta^{18}\text{O}$  fractionation during calcite deposition ranges  
367 between  $-0.24\text{‰}/\text{°C}$  (<sup>51</sup>) and  $-0.18\text{‰}/\text{°C}$  (<sup>52</sup>) and counterbalances the  
368 temperature-dependent isotope fractionation of atmospheric precipitation  
369 outside the cave. Accordingly, rainfall amount is the principal driver of  $\delta^{18}\text{O}_{\text{spel}}$  in  
370 the study area as supported by previous studies in the western  
371 Mediterranean<sup>18,23,27,48,49,53</sup>. The same effect prevails in Central Italy<sup>54</sup>, the  
372 nearest speleothem record from Italy, as well as in Macedonia (F.Y.R.O.M)<sup>55</sup>, the  
373 nearest speleothem record on the Balkan side of the Adriatic Sea. However,  
374 rainfall amount oscillations should also affect the rate of bedrock dissolution that  
375 in turn could have an important impact on growth rate and the abundance of  
376 uranium in speleothems. During wet (and warm) climate stages, bedrock is  
377 subjected to a more intense dissolution because of the higher quantity of water  
378 and a higher input of  $\text{CO}_2$  from soil. Because of the higher amount of dissolved  
379 carbonate in the drip water and a possibly faster dripping in the cave,  
380 speleothem growth rate increases. The opposite (i.e. a growth rate decrease) is  
381 expected for dry stages, although this general condition might not be valid for  
382 complex karst networks and/or might vary with time<sup>56</sup>. At the same time, rapid  
383 dissolution of bedrock limits uranium alpha-recoil, i.e.  $^{234}\text{U}$  and  $^{238}\text{U}$  are equally  
384 leached from the bedrock<sup>23</sup>. Longer water residence times, typical of drier  
385 conditions, promote uranium alpha-recoil and higher  $[\text{}^{234}/\text{}^{238}\text{U}]_i$  ratios because of  
386 a more efficient leaching of  $^{234}\text{U}$ . If rainfall amount is the main regulator of  
387  $\delta^{18}\text{O}_{\text{PC}}$ , more negative values are expected during relatively wet periods, when  
388 growth rate increases and  $[\text{}^{234}/\text{}^{238}\text{U}]_i$  ratio decreases; on the contrary, less  
389 negative values are expected during relatively dry periods when growth rate  
390 decreases and the  $[\text{}^{234}/\text{}^{238}\text{U}]_i$  ratio increases. PC shows, within uncertainties, this  
391 pattern, confirming that rainfall amount was one of the principal driver of  $\delta^{18}\text{O}_{\text{PC}}$   
392 (Extended Data Figure 4). The agreement between the  $\delta^{18}\text{O}_{\text{PC}}$  pattern and the  
393 Greenland isotope record for most of the DO cycles, with more negative values  
394 during interstadials and less negative values during stadials, is an indirect  
395 confirmation of the rainfall amount effect as interstadials (stadials) were  
396 relatively wet (dry) in the Mediterranean realm<sup>18,27,48,49,54</sup>.

397 Vegetation bioproductivity controls  $\delta^{13}\text{C}$  of soil  $\text{CO}_2$  ( $\delta^{13}\text{C}_{\text{soil}}$ ) and thus  $\delta^{13}\text{C}$  in the  
398 infiltrating water ( $\delta^{13}\text{C}_{\text{iw}}$ ). Excluding endogenous factors,  $\delta^{13}\text{C}_{\text{spel}}$  ranges between  
399  $-14.0\text{‰}$  and  $-5.0\text{‰}$  for C3 plants<sup>22</sup>. More negative  $\delta^{13}\text{C}_{\text{iw-spel}}$  values are expected  
400 during periods of high bioproductivity, characteristic of humid and warm climate  
401 stages, while less negative  $\delta^{13}\text{C}_{\text{iw-spel}}$  values are expected during periods of low  
402 bioproductivity, typical of dry and cold climate stages.  $\delta^{13}\text{C}_{\text{PC}}$  shows the most  
403 significant oscillation during MIS 5 and 4, with lower values corresponding to  
404 interstadials and higher values corresponding to stadials, in agreement with  
405  $\delta^{18}\text{O}_{\text{PC}}$  oscillations. The only exogenous process that could cause a substantial  
406 increase in  $\delta^{13}\text{C}_{\text{iw-spel}}$  is the switch to C4 vegetation<sup>22</sup>. At the same time,  
407 endogenous phenomena such as sulphide-driven bedrock dissolution<sup>57</sup>, closed-  
408 system bedrock dissolution<sup>45</sup> and prior calcite precipitation (PCP)<sup>58</sup> also push  
409  $\delta^{13}\text{C}_{\text{iw-spel}}$  toward less negative values. Importantly, all these processes can be  
410 attributed to a relative dry climate, considering that C4 plants thrive in steppe-  
411 like environments and the endogenous processes are enhanced during times of  
412 reduced recharge. However, only PCP has an effect on both  $\delta^{13}\text{C}_{\text{iw-spel}}$  and  $\delta^{18}\text{O}_{\text{iw-}}$   
413 spel.

414 Concomitant variations of  $\delta^{13}\text{C}_{\text{PC}}$  and  $\delta^{18}\text{O}_{\text{PC}}$  during MIS 5 to 4 are thus attributed  
415 to rainfall and bioproductivity changes triggered by the interstadial-stadial  
416 cyclicity. However, during the concomitant excursion toward the highest values  
417 at  $105.2^{+2.4}/_{-2.3}$  to  $102.4^{+2.1}/_{-2.0}$  ka,  $95.7^{+0.9}/_{-0.8}$  to  $93.1^{+0.7}/_{-0.9}$  ka,  $66.7^{+0.9}/_{-1.2}$  to  
418  $65.6^{+1.1}/_{-1.3}$  ka, and  $55.3^{+1.1}/_{-2.5}$  to  $54.9^{+1.1}/_{-2.7}$  ka and especially when  $\delta^{13}\text{C}_{\text{PC}}$  is  
419 above  $\sim -5\text{‰}$  it is possible that the above-mentioned processes might have  
420 played a role in increasing  $\delta^{13}\text{C}_{\text{PC}}$  and  $\delta^{18}\text{O}_{\text{PC}}$ . We consider PCP as the main  
421 endogenous process increasing  $\delta^{13}\text{C}_{\text{iw}}$  and  $\delta^{18}\text{O}_{\text{iw}}$ , because rapid shifts in  $\delta^{13}\text{C}_{\text{PC}}$   
422 and  $\delta^{18}\text{O}_{\text{PC}}$  toward high values occur simultaneously. Sulphide-driven bedrock  
423 dissolution can be excluded because of the lack of sulphide minerals in the Pozzo  
424 Cucù bedrock.

425 During MIS 3,  $\delta^{13}\text{C}_{\text{PC}}$  and  $\delta^{18}\text{O}_{\text{PC}}$  do not covary.  $\delta^{13}\text{C}_{\text{PC}}$  shows a pattern  
426 characterised by negligible oscillations with values around  $\sim -8\text{‰}$ ;  $\delta^{18}\text{O}_{\text{PC}}$  shows  
427 millennial-scale DO-like oscillations of  $\sim -1\text{‰}$ , lower than during MIS 5 and 4,  
428 and a general trend toward less negative values. The lack of a covariation  
429 between  $\delta^{13}\text{C}_{\text{PC}}$  and  $\delta^{18}\text{O}_{\text{PC}}$  argues against PCP; mixing of groundwater or in-karst  
430 kinetic processes (for example: evaporation) are excluded for the same reason.  
431 The relatively negative values of  $\sim -8\text{‰}$  are inconsistent with closed system and  
432 sulphide-driven bedrock dissolution. Even speleothems deposited from water in  
433 contact with  $\text{CO}_2$  derived from old organic matter trapped in bedrock fissures  
434 would result in  $\delta^{13}\text{C}$  values higher than  $\sim -8\text{‰}$ . Thus,  $\delta^{13}\text{C}_{\text{PC}}$  reflects soil  
435 bioproductivity, which remained rather stable throughout MIS 3. This means  
436 that variations in rainfall (and temperature) during MIS 3 in Apulia were too  
437 small to cause significant perturbations in  $\delta^{13}\text{C}_{\text{soil}}$ . This limited rainfall variation,  
438 together with a decreased resolution in this part of the record could explain the  
439 small  $\sim -1\text{‰}$  excursions of  $\delta^{18}\text{O}_{\text{PC}}$ .

440 Finally,  $\delta^{18}\text{O}_{\text{PC}}$  possibly responded to variations of moisture source during the  
441 entire MIS 5 to 3 period. Today, the study area receives most rainfall from the  
442 Atlantic, with a smaller contribution from the Mediterranean Sea<sup>59</sup>. Atlantic-  
443 sourced  $\delta^{18}\text{O}_{\text{rw}}$  is more negative than Mediterranean-sourced  $\delta^{18}\text{O}_{\text{rw}}$ , and the  
444 influence of the former is related to: 1) abundance of moisture produced in the  
445 Atlantic and 2) the efficiency of the Westerlies delivering this moisture in the

446 Mediterranean area. When polar ice sheets expanded, the influence of Atlantic-  
447 sourced moisture decreased in favour of Mediterranean-sourced moisture,  
448 because the production of moisture in the Atlantic is lower and westerlies  
449 trajectories changes. With all the other effects negligible, the source effect<sup>60</sup>  
450 would generally follow DO cyclicity leading to more negative  $\delta^{18}\text{O}$  values during  
451 interstadials and less negative values during stadials. However, at some point in  
452 the MIS 3, the Westerlies were pushed southward in response to the expansion  
453 of the Northern ice sheet. Rainfall in the Mediterranean was then controlled by  
454 the genesis of low pressure areas (cyclones) within in the Mediterranean realm.  
455 Although periods of increasing versus decreasing rainfall might still follow  
456 regional-scale DO cyclicity, rainfall amount changes are inferior than during MIS  
457 5 and 4, because the availability of moisture is lower than when the Atlantic is  
458 the principal moisture source. A possible interpretation of the  $\delta^{18}\text{O}_{\text{PC}}$  signature  
459 during MIS 3 invokes a major influence of Mediterranean-derived rainfall  
460 causing a gradual trend of rainfall reduction, with a superimposed low-intensity  
461 rainfall amount increase versus decrease pattern (following DO cyclicity). It is  
462 important to stress that both the gradual rainfall reduction as well as rainfall  
463 decrease during MIS 3 GIs in Apulia were insufficient to cause significant  
464 perturbations in  $\delta^{13}\text{C}_{\text{soil}}$ , as for example during MIS 5 and 4.  
465

#### 466 **Acknowledgements**

467 The authors thank all the local speleologists that helped in the 2014 and 2019  
468 fieldwork at Pozzo Cucù, Sant'Angelo, Zaccaria and Messapi caves: Gigi  
469 Loperfido, Salvatore Inguscio, Giovanni Ragone, Piero Lippolis, Alessio  
470 Lacirignola, Donatella Leserri, Michele Marraffa, Orlando Lacarbonara, Fabio  
471 Semeraro, Sebastiano Calella, Pasquale Calella, Claudio Pastore, Claudio  
472 Marchitelli, Rosanna Romanazzi, Roberto Cupertino, Giovanni Caló e Franco  
473 Lorusso (belonging to the Gruppo Speleologico Martinese, CARS Altamura,  
474 Gruppo Speleologico Neretino, Gruppo Ricerche Carsiche Putignano, Gruppo  
475 Puglia Grotte and Gruppo Escursionistico Speleologico Ostunense), as well as the  
476 Bellanova family for access to Messapi Cave. AC, JDW and VC are also grateful to  
477 all members of the Gruppo Speleologico Martinese for their logistic help and the  
478 warm hospitality in Martina Franca. Thanks also to Mario Parise (University of  
479 Bari) for the help during 2014 fieldwork, Alessandro Reina (Polytechnic  
480 University of Bari) for his enthusiasm in supporting this research, Victor Casulli  
481 and Rosanna Laragione of Castellana Grotte srl for their interest in supporting  
482 this study, Manuela Wimmer and Marc Luetscher (Innsbruck University) for  
483 their help during lab work, Luca Pisani (Bologna University) for the DEM figure  
484 used in Extended Data Figure 1, Laura Calabrò (Bologna University) for the  
485 drilling of sample SA1. AC is supported by Leonardo Da Vinci Grant 2019 - DD  
486 MIUR No 787, 15/04/2019, SB is supported by ERC grant n. 724046 – SUCCESS  
487 <https://ERC-SUCCESS.eu>, and HC by NSFC 41888101 grant. This research  
488 received financial contributions from Grotte di Castellana srl and from  
489 Federazione Speleologica Pugliese. Special thanks to Prof. John Stewart and two  
490 anonymous reviewers for their comments that helped to improve the paper.  
491

#### 492 **Competing interests**

493  
494 The authors declare no competing interests

495 **Data availability**  
496 Supplementary Table 1 and 2  
497

498 **Authors contribution**

499 AC and VC conceived and designed the experiments, AC, VC, CS, JH, HC performed  
500 the experiments, AC and SB analyzed the data, AC, VC, CS, SB, JDW contributed  
501 with materials/analysis tools, AC wrote the paper with inputs from all coauthors.  
502

503 **References**

504

- 505 1 Benazzi, S. *et al.* Early dispersal of modern humans in Europe and  
506 implications for Neanderthal behaviour. *Nature* **479**, 525-529 (2011).
- 507 2 Wolf, D. *et al.* Climate deteriorations and Neanderthal demise in interior  
508 Iberia. *Scientific Reports* **8**, 7048, doi:10.1038/s41598-018-25343-6  
509 (2018).
- 510 3 Mellars, P. A new radiocarbon revolution and the dispersal of modern  
511 humans in Eurasia. *Nature* **439**, 931-935, doi:10.1038/nature04521  
512 (2006).
- 513 4 Müller, U. C. *et al.* The role of climate in the spread of modern humans into  
514 Europe. *Quaternary Science Reviews* **30**, 273-279,  
515 doi:10.1016/j.quascirev.2010.11.016 (2011).
- 516 5 Staubwasser, M. *et al.* Impact of climate change on the transition of  
517 Neanderthals to modern humans in Europe. *Proceedings of the National*  
518 *Academy of Sciences* **115**, 9116-9121 (2018).
- 519 6 Melchionna, M. *et al.* Fragmentation of Neanderthals' pre-extinction  
520 distribution by climate change. *Palaeogeography, Palaeoclimatology,*  
521 *Palaeoecology* **496**, 146-154 (2018).
- 522 7 Finlayson, C. & Carrion, J. S. Rapid ecological turnover and its impact on  
523 Neanderthal and other human populations. *Trends Ecol Evol* **22**, 213-222,  
524 doi:10.1016/j.tree.2007.02.001 (2007).
- 525 8 Stewart, J. R. The ecology and adaptation of Neanderthals during the non-  
526 analogue environment of Oxygen Isotope Stage 3. *Quaternary*  
527 *International* **137**, 35-46 (2005).
- 528 9 Benazzi, S. *et al.* The makers of the Protoaurignacian and implications for  
529 Neandertal extinction. *Science* **348**, 793-796 (2015).
- 530 10 Genty, D. *et al.* Precise dating of Dansgaard– Oeschger climate oscillations  
531 in western Europe from stalagmite data. *Nature* **42**, 833-837 (2003).
- 532 11 Pérez-Mejías, C. *et al.* Orbital-to-millennial scale climate variability during  
533 Marine Isotope Stages 5 to 3 in northeast Iberia. *Quaternary Science*  
534 *Reviews* **224**, doi:10.1016/j.quascirev.2019.105946 (2019).
- 535 12 Badino, F. *et al.* An overview of Alpine and Mediterranean  
536 palaeogeography, terrestrial ecosystems and climate history during MIS 3  
537 with focus on the Middle to Upper Palaeolithic transition. *Quaternary*  
538 *International*, doi:10.1016/j.quaint.2019.09.024 (2019).
- 539 13 Higham, T. *et al.* The timing and spatiotemporal patterning of Neanderthal  
540 disappearance. *Nature* **512**, 306 (2014).
- 541 14 Rey-Rodríguez, I. *et al.* Last Neanderthals and first Anatomically Modern  
542 Humans in the NW Iberian Peninsula: Climatic and environmental  
543 conditions inferred from the Cova Eirós small-vertebrate assemblage  
544 during MIS 3. *Quaternary Science Reviews* **151**, 185-197 (2016).
- 545 15 NGRIP Members. High-resolution record of Northern Hemisphere climate  
546 extending into the last interglacial period. *Nature* **431**, 147-151 (2004).
- 547 16 Kudielka, G. *et al.* Implications for central Italy paleoclimate from 95,000  
548 yr BP until the early Holocene as evident from Frassassi Cave speleothems.  
549 *250 Million Years of Earth History in Central Italy: Celebrating 25 Years of*  
550 *the Geological Observatory of Coldigioco* **542**, 429 (2019).

- 551 17 Budsky, A. *et al.* Western Mediterranean climate response to  
552 Dansgaard/Oeschger events: new insights from speleothem records.  
553 *Geophysical Research Letters*, 9042-9053, doi:10.1029/2019GL084009  
554 (2019).
- 555 18 Denniston, R. F. *et al.* A stalagmite test of North Atlantic SST and Iberian  
556 hydroclimate linkages over the last two glacial cycles. *Climate of the Past*  
557 **14**, 1893-1913, doi:10.5194/cp-14-1893-2018 (2018).
- 558 19 Badertscher, S. *et al.* Pleistocene water intrusions from the Mediterranean  
559 and Caspian seas into the Black Sea. *Nature Geoscience* **4**, 236-239,  
560 doi:10.1038/ngeo1106 (2011).
- 561 20 Bar-Matthews, M., Ayalon, A., Gilmour, M., Matthews, A. & Hawkesworth,  
562 C. J. Sea-land oxygen isotopic relationships from planktonic foraminifera  
563 and speleothems in the Eastern Mediterranean region and their  
564 implication for paleorainfall during interglacial intervals. *Geochimica et*  
565 *Cosmochimica Acta* **67**, 3181-3199, doi:10.1016/s0016-7037(02)01031-1  
566 (2003).
- 567 21 Yasur, G. *et al.* Climatic and environmental conditions in the Western  
568 Galilee, during Late Middle and Upper Paleolithic periods, based on  
569 speleothems from Manot Cave, Israel. *Journal of Human Evolution*,  
570 doi:10.1016/j.jhevol.2019.04.004 (2019).
- 571 22 McDermott, F. Palaeo-climate reconstruction from stable isotope  
572 variations in speleothems: a review. *Quaternary Science Reviews* **23**, 901-  
573 918, doi:10.1016/j.quascirev.2003.06.021 (2004).
- 574 23 Drysdale, R. N. *et al.* Evidence for obliquity forcing of glacial Termination  
575 II. *Science* **325**, 1527-1531, doi:10.1126/science.1170371 (2009).
- 576 24 Luetscher, M. *et al.* North Atlantic storm track changes during the Last  
577 Glacial Maximum recorded by Alpine speleothems. *Nature*  
578 *Communications* **6**, 6344, doi:10.1038/ncomms7344 (2015).
- 579 25 Rasmussen, S. O. *et al.* A stratigraphic framework for abrupt climatic  
580 changes during the Last Glacial period based on three synchronized  
581 Greenland ice-core records: refining and extending the INTIMATE event  
582 stratigraphy. *Quaternary Science Reviews* **106**, 14-28,  
583 doi:10.1016/j.quascirev.2014.09.007 (2014).
- 584 26 Cheng, H. *et al.* The climatic cyclicity in semiarid - arid central Asia over  
585 the past 500,000 years. *Geophysical Research Letters* **39**  
586 <https://doi.org/10.1029/2011GL050202> (2012).
- 587 27 Columbu, A. *et al.* A long record of MIS 7 and MIS 5 climate and  
588 environment from a western Mediterranean speleothem (SW Sardinia,  
589 Italy). *Quaternary Science Reviews* **220**, 230-243 (2019).
- 590 28 Allen, J. R. M. *et al.* Rapid environmental changes in southern Europe  
591 during the last glacial period. *Science* **400**, 740-743 (1999).
- 592 29 Tzedakis, P. C., Hooghiemstra, H. & Pälike, H. The last 1.35 million years at  
593 Tenaghi Philippon: revised chronostratigraphy and long-term vegetation  
594 trends. *Quaternary Science Reviews* **25**, 3416-3430,  
595 doi:10.1016/j.quascirev.2006.09.002 (2006).
- 596 30 Toucanne, S. *et al.* Tracking rainfall in the northern Mediterranean  
597 borderlands during sapropel deposition. *Quaternary Science Reviews* **129**,  
598 178-195, doi:10.1016/j.quascirev.2015.10.016 (2015).

- 599 31 Hodell, D. A., Channell, J. E. T., Curtis, J. H., Romero, O. E. & Röhl, U. Onset  
600 of “Hudson strait” Heinrich events in the eastern North Atlantic at the end  
601 of the middle Pleistocene transition (~640 ka)?: Pleistocene Heinrich  
602 events. *Paleoceanography* **23**, <https://doi.org/10.1029/2008PA001591>  
603 (2008).
- 604 32 Kaufmann, G. & Dreybrodt, W. Stalagmite growth and palaeo-climate: an  
605 inverse approach. *Earth and Planetary Science Letters* **224**, 529-545  
606 (2004).
- 607 33 Columbu, A. *et al.* A long continuous palaeoclimate-palaeoenvironmental  
608 record of the last glacial period from southern Italy and implications for  
609 the coexistence of Anatomically Modern Humans and Neanderthals.  
610 Preceedings of the European Geosciences Union (EGU) Conference. doi:  
611 <https://doi.org/10.5194/egusphere-egu2020-140> (2020)
- 612 34 Stewart, J. & Stringer, B. Human evolution out of Africa: the role of refugia  
613 and climate change. *Science* **335**, 1317-1321 (2012).
- 614 35 Ait Brahim, Y. *et al.* North Atlantic ice-rafting, ocean and atmospheric  
615 circulation during the Holocene: insights from Western Mediterranean  
616 speleothems. *Geophysical Research Letters* **46**,  
617 doi:10.1029/2019GL082405 (2019).
- 618 36 Sano, K. *et al.* The earliest evidence for mechanically delivered projectile  
619 weapons in Europe. *Nature Ecology & Evolution* **3**, 1409-1414 (2019).
- 620 37 Arrighi, S. *et al.* Backdating systematic shell ornament making in Europe  
621 to 45,000 years ago. *Archaeological and Anthropological Sciences* **12**, 59  
622 (2020).
- 623 38 Arrighi, S. *et al.* Bone tools, ornaments and other unusual objects during  
624 the Middle to Upper Palaeolithic transition in Italy. *Quaternary*  
625 *International* (2019).
- 626 39 Marciani, G. *et al.* Lithic techno-complexes in Italy from 50 to 39 thousand  
627 years BP: An overview of lithic technological changes across the Middle-  
628 Upper Palaeolithic boundary. *Quaternary International* (2019).
- 629 40 Drysdale, R. N. *et al.* Precise microsampling of poorly laminated  
630 speleothems for U-series dating. *Quaternary Geochronology* **14**, 38-47,  
631 doi:10.1016/j.quageo.2012.06.009 (2012).
- 632 41 Hellstrom, J. U-Th dating of speleothems with high initial  $^{230}\text{Th}$  using  
633 stratigraphical constraint. *Quaternary Geochronology* **1**, 289-295,  
634 doi:10.1016/j.quageo.2007.01.004 (2006).
- 635 42 Cheng, H. *et al.* Improvements in  $^{230}\text{Th}$  dating,  $^{230}\text{Th}$  and  $^{234}\text{U}$  half-life  
636 values, and U-Th isotopic measurements by multi-collector inductively  
637 coupled plasma mass spectrometry. *Earth and Planetary Science Letters*  
638 **371-372**, 82-91, doi:10.1016/j.epsl.2013.04.006 (2013).
- 639 43 Scholz, D. & Hoffmann, D. L. StalAge – An algorithm designed for  
640 construction of speleothem age models. *Quaternary Geochronology* **6**,  
641 369-382, doi:10.1016/j.quageo.2011.02.002 (2011).
- 642 44 Breitenbach, S. F. M. *et al.* COConstructing Proxy-Record Age models  
643 (COPRA). *Climate of the Past* **8**, 1765-1779 (2012).
- 644 45 Hendy, C. H. The isotopic geochemistry of speleothems-I. The calculation  
645 of the effects of different modes of formation on the isotopic composition  
646 of speleothems and their applicability as palaeoclimatic indicators.  
647 *Geochimica et Cosmochimica Acta* **35**, 801-824 (1971).

- 648 46 Mickler, P. J., Stern, L. A. & Banner, J. L. Large kinetic isotope effects in  
649 modern speleothems. *Geological Society of America Bulletin* **118**, 65-81  
650 (2006).
- 651 47 Dreybrodt, W. & Scholz, D. Climatic dependence of stable carbon and  
652 oxygen isotope signals recorded in speleothems: From soil water to  
653 speleothem calcite. *Geochimica et Cosmochimica Acta* **75**, 734-752,  
654 doi:10.1016/j.gca.2010.11.002 (2011).
- 655 48 Columbu, A., Sauro, F., Lundberg, J., Drysdale, R. & De Waele, J.  
656 Palaeoenvironmental changes recorded by speleothems of the southern  
657 Alps (Piani Eterni, Belluno, Italy) during four interglacial to glacial climate  
658 transitions. *Quaternary Science Reviews* **197**, 319-335,  
659 doi:https://doi.org/10.1016/j.quascirev.2018.08.006 (2018).
- 660 49 Columbu, A. *et al.* Early last glacial intra-interstadial climate variability  
661 recorded in a Sardinian speleothem. *Quaternary Science Reviews* **169**,  
662 391-397, doi:10.1016/j.quascirev.2017.05.007 (2017).
- 663 50 Bard, E. *et al.* Hydrological conditions over the western Mediterranean  
664 basin during the deposition of the cold Sapropel 6 (ca. 175 Kyr BP). *Earth  
665 and Planetary Science Letters* **202**, 481-494 (2002).
- 666 51 Kim, S.-T. & O'Neil, J. R. Equilibrium and nonequilibrium oxygen isotope  
667 effects in synthetic carbonates. *Geochimica et Cosmochimica Acta* **61**,  
668 3461-3475, doi:10.1016/s0016-7037(97)00169-5 (1997).
- 669 52 Tremaine, D. M., Froelich, P. N. & Wang, Y. Speleothem calcite farmed in  
670 situ: Modern calibration of  $\delta^{18}\text{O}$  and  $\delta^{13}\text{C}$  paleoclimate proxies in a  
671 continuously-monitored natural cave system. *Geochimica et  
672 Cosmochimica Acta* **75**, 4929-4950 (2011).
- 673 53 Drysdale, R. N. *et al.* Stalagmite evidence for the precise timing of North  
674 Atlantic cold events during the early last glacial. *Geology* **35**, 77-80,  
675 doi:10.1130/g23161a.1 (2007).
- 676 54 Vanghi, V. *et al.* Climate variability on the Adriatic seaboard during the  
677 last glacial inception and MIS 5c from Frassassi Cave stalagmite record.  
678 *Quaternary Science Reviews* **201**, 349-361,  
679 doi:10.1016/j.quascirev.2018.10.023 (2018).
- 680 55 Regattieri, E. *et al.* A MIS 9/MIS 8 speleothem record of hydrological  
681 variability from Macedonia (F.Y.R.O.M.). *Global and Planetary Change* **162**,  
682 39-52, doi:10.1016/j.gloplacha.2018.01.003 (2018).
- 683 56 Ford, D. & Williams, P. Karst geomorphology and hydrology. *John Wiley &  
684 Sons, Chichester* (2007).
- 685 57 Bajo, P. *et al.* Stalagmite carbon isotopes and dead carbon proportion  
686 (DCP) in a near-closed-system situation: An interplay between sulphuric  
687 and carbonic acid dissolution. *Geochimica et Cosmochimica Acta* **210**, 208-  
688 227, doi:10.1016/j.gca.2017.04.038 (2017).
- 689 58 Fairchild, I. J. & Treble, P. C. Trace elements in speleothems as recorders  
690 of environmental change. *Quaternary Science Reviews* **28**, 449-468,  
691 doi:10.1016/j.quascirev.2008.11.007 (2009).
- 692 59 Longinelli, A. & Selmo, E. Isotopic composition of precipitation in Italy: a  
693 first overall map. *Journal of Hydrology* **270**, 75 - 88 (2003).
- 694 60 Dansgaard, W. Stable isotopes in precipitation. *Tellus* **16**, 436-468 (1964).
- 695 61 Lisiecki, L. E. & Raymo, M. E. A Pliocene-Pleistocene stack of 57 globally  
696 distributed benthic  $\delta^{18}\text{O}$  records. *Paleoceanography* **20**, 1-17 (2005).

697 62 Frisia, S., Borsato, A., Preto, N. & McDermott, F. Late Holocene annual  
698 growth in three Alpine stalagmites records the influence of solar activity  
699 and the North Atlantic Oscillation on winter climate. *Earth and Planetary  
700 Science Letters* **216**, 411-424, doi:10.1016/s0012-821x(03)00515-6  
701 (2003).

702 63 Johnston, V. E. *et al.* Evidence of thermophilisation and elevation-  
703 dependent warming during the Last Interglacial in the Italian Alps.  
704 *Scientific Reports* **8**, 2680, doi:10.1038/s41598-018-21027-3 (2018).

705 64 Belli, R. *et al.* Regional climate variability and ecosystem responses to the  
706 last deglaciation in the northern hemisphere from stable isotope data and  
707 calcite fabrics in two northern Adriatic stalagmites. *Quaternary Science  
708 Reviews* **72**, 146-158 (2013).

709 65 Pozzi, J. P. *et al.* U-Th dated speleothem recorded geomagnetic excursions  
710 in the Lower Brunhes. *Scientific Reports* **9**, 1114, doi:10.1038/s41598-  
711 018-38350-4 (2019).

712 66 Regattieri, E. *et al.* Holocene Critical Zone dynamics in an Alpine  
713 catchment inferred from a speleothem multiproxy record: disentangling  
714 climate and human influences. *Scientific Reports* **9**, doi:10.1038/s41598-  
715 019-53583-7 (2019).

716 67 Regattieri, E. *et al.* A continuous stable isotope record from the  
717 penultimate glacial maximum to the Last Interglacial (159–121ka) from  
718 Tana Che Urla Cave (Apuan Alps, central Italy). *Quaternary Research* **82**,  
719 450-461, doi:10.1016/j.yqres.2014.05.005 (2014).

720 68 Isola, I. *et al.* Speleothem U/Th age constraints for the Last Glacial  
721 conditions in the Apuan Alps, northwestern Italy. *Palaeogeography,  
722 Palaeoclimatology, Palaeoecology* **518**, 62-71,  
723 doi:10.1016/j.palaeo.2019.01.001 (2019).

724 69 Columbu, A. *et al.* Late quaternary speleogenesis and landscape evolution  
725 in the northern Apennine evaporite areas. *Earth Surface Processes and  
726 Landforms* **42**, 1447-1459 (2017).

727 70 Frisia, S. *et al.* Holocene climate variability in Sicily from a discontinuous  
728 stalagmite record and the Mesolithic to Neolithic transition. *Quaternary  
729 Research* **66**, 388-400 (2006).

730 71 Francke, A. *et al.* Sedimentological processes and environmental  
731 variability at Lake Ohrid (Macedonia, Albania) between 637 ka and the  
732 present. *Biogeosciences* **13**, 1179-1196, doi:10.5194/bg-13-1179-2016  
733 (2016).

734 72 Moseley, G. E. *et al.* NALPS19: Sub-orbital scale climate variability  
735 recorded in Northern Alpine speleothems during the last glacial period.  
736 *Climate of the Past*, 29-50, doi:10.5194/cp-16-29-2020 (2020).  
737  
738

739 **Figure 1.** A) PC stalagmite, sampling information and age model (see methods  
740 for age model construction and Hendy test). B) Ages of published Italian  
741 stalagmites used for palaeoclimate reconstruction and those presented in this  
742 study, compared to interglacial versus glacial variation over the last ~500 ka  
743 (curves: Greenland ice core  $\delta^{18}\text{O}$  (purple)<sup>15</sup> and Atlantic benthic foraminifera  
744  $\delta^{18}\text{O}$  (black)<sup>61</sup>. The background shows a map of Italy with the location of the  
745 studied cave (red star) and other published speleothem records. Ages are  
746 marked by dots; solid lines indicate continuous growth while dotted lines stand  
747 for discontinuous growth and/or poor chronological constraint. Only  
748 speleothems from Apulia (this study, red labels) continuously grew over the  
749 entire last glacial period (gray shade). Speleothems: PE (Piani Eterni karst  
750 system)<sup>48</sup>, ER (Ernesto Cave)<sup>62</sup>, CB (Cesare Battisti Cave)<sup>63</sup>, Sa (Savi Cave)<sup>64</sup>, Ba  
751 (Basura Cave)<sup>65</sup>, RM (Rio Martino Cave)<sup>66</sup>, TCU (Tana che Urla Cave)<sup>67</sup>, GDV  
752 (Grotta del Vento)<sup>68</sup>, Ren (Renella Cave)<sup>69</sup>, CC (Corchia Cave)<sup>53</sup>, Gypsum  
753 (Northern Italy Gypsum caves)<sup>69</sup>, Fr (Frasassi Cave)<sup>16,54</sup>, SA (Sant'Angelo Cave,  
754 this study), Za (Zaccaria Cave, this study), Tr (Trullo Cave, this study), PC (Pozzo  
755 Cucù Cave, this study), BMS (Bue Marino Cave)<sup>49</sup>, CA (Crovasa Azzurra Cave)<sup>27</sup>,  
756 Car (Carburangeli Cave)<sup>70</sup>.

757  
758 **Figure 2.** PC  $\delta^{13}\text{C}$  (top, red) and  $\delta^{18}\text{O}$  (bottom, blue) versus Greenland ice core  
759  $\delta^{18}\text{O}$  (middle, black)<sup>15</sup>. Black numbers and bars refer to DO cycles<sup>25</sup>. The PC  
760 proxy record is correlated to NGRIP along stadial events (grey shading).  
761 Intermittent shading is used when correlation is ambiguous. Boxes on the  
762 bottom show MIS and H events, as well as the Neanderthal-MH transition in  
763 Apulia and MUPT in Europe. PC  $\delta^{13}\text{C}$  and  $\delta^{18}\text{O}$  curves also show age  $2\sigma$ -  
764 uncertainties (shaded horizontal bars).

765  
766 **Figure 3.** PC  $\delta^{18}\text{O}$  record (grey) compared to marine (a. GDEC-4-2<sup>30</sup>) and  
767 lacustrine (b. Monticchio Lake<sup>28</sup>; c. Tenaghi Philippon Lake<sup>29</sup>; d. Ohrid Lake<sup>71</sup>)  
768 archives, as well as circum-Mediterranean speleothems (e. Cueva Victoria  $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ ,  
769 yellow line<sup>17</sup> (refer to black axis/numbers); Ejulve Cave  $\delta^{13}\text{C}$ , purple line<sup>11</sup>;  
770 Buraca Gloriosa, pink line<sup>18</sup>; Sofular Cave  $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ , green line<sup>19</sup> (refer to black  
771 axis/numbers); Corchia Cave  $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ , orange dotted line<sup>53</sup>; Frasassi Cave  
772 (composite), orange line<sup>16</sup> g. Villars Cave  $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ , green line<sup>10</sup>; NALPS19 record  
773  $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ , blue line<sup>72</sup>; h. Soreq cave  $\delta^{18}\text{O}$ , brown line<sup>19</sup>).

774